## STATE OF NEW HAMPSHIRE

SUPREME COURT

2015 TERM

November

No. 2015-0274

DONNA M. GREEN

W

SCHOOL ADMINISTRATIVE UNIT #55, EARL F. METZLER, II, TIMBERLANE REGIONAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, AND NANCY STEENSON

## BRIEF FOR APPELLEES

Counsel for Appellees:

Matthew R. Serge, Esq. NHBA #14243 Anna B. Cole, Esq. NHBA #20667 DRUMMOND WOODSUM & MacMAHON 1001 Elm Street, Suite 303 Manchester, NH 03101-1845 (603) 716-2895

Oral Argument to be presented by:

Matthew R. Serge, Esq.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	rage
TABLE OF CONTENTS	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	ii
STATEMENT OF THE CASE AND FACTS	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	5
ARGUMENT	6
A. THE SUPERIOR COURT DID NOT ERR IN HOLDING THAT RSA 91-A:4, V DOES NOT REQUIRE THE SCHOOL DISTRICT TO PROVIDE THE APPELLANT WITH A COPY OF GOVERNMENTAL RECORDS IN ELECTRONIC FORMAT	
2. NEW HAMPSHIRE'S RIGHT TO KNOW LAW ENSURES THAT CITIZENS HAVE THE RIGHT TO ACCESS GOVERNMENTAL RECORDS AND INFORMATION FOR PURPOSES OF INSPECTION, NOT THAT THEY HAVE THE RIGHT TO COPIES OF SUCH RECORDS OR INFORMATION IN THE FORMAT OF THEIR CHOOSING	
3. THE EQUITIES DO NOT REQUIRE THAT THE APPELLEES PROVIDE THE APPELLANT WITH COPIES OF THE REQUESTED GOVERMENTAL RECORDS IN ELECTRONIC FORMAT	11
CONCLUSION	12
REQUEST FOR ORAL ARGUMENT	13
CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE	13
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	13

# TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases: New Hampshire	Page
Brent v. Paquette, 132 N.H. 415 (1989)	7
Farm Family Cas. Ins. Co. v. Town of Rollinsford, 155 N.H. 669 (2007)	6
Gallagher v. Town of Windham, 121 N.H. 156 (1981)	8
In the Matter of Bazemore & Jack, 153 N.H. 351 (2006)	9
Menge v. City of Manchester, 113 N.H. 533 (1973)	5, 11
Murray v. N.H. Div. of State Police, 154 N.H. 579 (2006)	6
N.H. Civil Liberties Union v. City of Manchester, 149 N.H. 437 (2003)	7
North Hampton Racing and Breeding Association, Inc. v. New Hampshire Racing Commission, 94 N.H. 156 (1946)	9
Union Leader Corp. v. City of Nashua, 141 N.H. 473 (1996)	6
Winnacunnet Co-op. School Dist. v. Town of Seabrook, 148 N.H. 519 (2002)	7
Zorn v. Demetri, 158 N.H. 437 (2009)	7
Statutes: New Hampshire	
RSA 21:1	7
RSA 21:2	7
RSA 91-A:1	9
RSA 91-A:1-a, III	8
RSA 91-A:4, I	7
RSA 91-A:4, IV	4, 8
RSA 91-A:4, V	8, 9, 11

## **Statutes: Out of State**

D.C. CODE §2-532	10
MINN. STAT. §13.03	10
R.I. GEN. LAWS §38-2-3	10
1 V.S.A. §316	10. 11

## STATEMENT OF THE CASE AND FACTS

The Appellant, Donna Green, is a member of the Timberlane Regional School Board, and self-described blogger who posts information and opinions online about Timberlane issues. On January 23, 2015, the Appellant made a Right to Know request to the Timberlane Regional School Board, stating:

Please be advised that I, School Board member Donna Green, request an opportunity to inspect and possibly copy the following documents: the 2014-15 salary detail printout from Timberlane's financial software program for the entire Timberlane district staff, and the same for the proposed budget of 2015-16.

Appendix to Brief for Appellant (App.1) at 17. In response, Nancy Steenson, Chair of the Timberlane Regional School Board, stated on January 26, 2015 that the Appellant could make an appointment to access the requested documents. App.1 at 19. Because the Appellant had originally asked for printouts of the information for both herself and the Timberlane School Board (which the Appellant stated was a "simple printout from your financial system"), Mr. Steenson cautioned that she would not authorize hundreds of pages of documents to be distributed to all board members at the Appellant's request alone. App.1 at 19. The Appellant then responded the same day, "in that case, give me the file electronically and we will all save money and time...." App.1 at 20.

Ms. Steenson again referred to her initial response, informing the Appellant that she could make an appointment with Mr. Stokinger, business administrator for SAU #55, to inspect the requested records. App.1 at 21. Rather than inspecting the requested records, however, the Appellant stated "[m]y request is for an electronic file of the salary detail – or a paper report, whichever suits the district. I am not making an appointment with Mr. Stokinger – and even

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Appellant had made an earlier request for the same materials outside of the RSA 91-A process, and requested information for herself and the entire school board.

more so given tomorrow all offices will be closed." (emphasis added). App.1 at 22. The Appellant then sent another e-mail shortly thereafter to Ms. Steenson saying:

The proper response to a Right to Know request is to hand over what is in the immediate control of the person in charge of the documents. All the documents requested could have been emailed or copied in the time it has taken to answer these excuses for not providing a school board member with documents.

This isn't that difficult. The NH AG's Office and Secretary of State respond to 91-A requests all the time in a timely fashion. It is beyond reason as to why this office cannot do so. As per RSA 91-A a citizen or school board member is to receive a written explanation as to why an electronic copy was not simply emailed – as it is a document readily at hand.

App.1 at 23.

On January 26, 2015, three (3) days after the Appellant's initial request, Ms. Cathy Belcher, an Executive Assistant to SAU #55 Superintendent Dr. Earl F. Metzler II, sent an e-mail to the Appellant informing her that the requested information was available for immediate inspection and review, but requested the courtesy of making an appointment. App.1 at 24. Ms. Belcher also told the Appellant that the office was open Monday through Friday from 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. App.1 at 24.

As the Appellant was aware, the School District has a policy governing right to know requests. Among other things, the policy provides that:

Materials and/or documentation produced to fulfill a Right to Know request shall be subject to a charge of \$.50 per page (only hardcopies will be produced; no electronic copies will be provided) and shall be picked up at the Superintendent's office during normal business hours. For materials that can only be made available electronically (i.e. video recordings) requestors may provide their own thumb drive (in original, sealed packing only) or the District shall provide the thumb drive at the requester's expense.

App.1 at 29.

Rather than inspect the requested records, however, Appellant chose to write an e-mail to Ms. Belcher, stating:

How is the salary information stored? Does it have a separate access and function code?

Are you going to print it so it can be inspected? That seems obviously counterproductive.

Please e-mail me an electronic copy when the office reopens. If you will not comply with this request, I require the specific provision in the law by which you are refusing to provide this information. The people of Sandown whom I represent, expect your office to do everything possible to facilitate my requests for public information.

App.1 at 25. Ms. Belcher wrote to the Appellant on January 29, 2015 informing her that the information requested was "immediately available for public inspection." App.1 at 26. The Appellant once again refused to inspect the records and sent another e-mail, this time referring to a New Hampshire Supreme Court case with no explanation, and once again demanding that the electronic file with the salary information be emailed to her. She stated that "[t]his is public information and should be given to me in whatever output file format is supported by your financial software; e.g. pdf, export to spreadsheet, export to .c.s.v." App.1 at 27.

The Appellant subsequently filed a complaint in superior court against SAU #55, Earl F. Metzler, Timberlane Regional School District, and Nancy Steenson, claiming that they violated RSA 91-A (the Right to Know Law) by failing to provide her a copy of the requested salary information in electronic form. App.1 at 5-16. The Appellant also filed a separate claim for access to a video surveillance recording that apparently captured an altercation between the Appellant and Ms. Belcher in which, reportedly, the Appellant was "both disrespectful and harassing to several employees." App.1 at 12-14; Appendix to Brief for Appellees (App.2) at 15. The videotape was eventually released and the Appellant withdrew that portion of her complaint.

The Appellees moved to dismiss the Appellant's petition arguing, in part, that they were not obligated under the Right to Know Law to provide her with a copy of governmental records in electronic format, and that it was undisputed that indeed the Appellees responded to the request and made the records available for inspection and copying. App.2 at 16-22. A final hearing was held before the Superior Court (Anderson, J.) on March 6, 2015. During the hearing, the Appellant conceded that the Appellees did provide her access to the requested governmental records, but that the information was worthless because "having it in electronic format allows me to manipulate the information and do data mining. That's what I need to do." Transcript of March 6, 2015 hearing (T.) at 12-13. The Appellant also claimed that it was the Appellee's obligation to provide her with requested records in "the most useful form for the individual seeking the information." Thus, she stated that "if it was created in electronic form, it was stored in electronic form, and the only way to do data mining is to have it in electronic form." T. at 14. Nonetheless, the Appellant ultimately conceded that she "was prepared to take it in paper as long as [she] wasn't made to pay for it." T. at 14.

On March 9, 2015, the court dismissed the Appellant's complaint, ruling that she was not entitled to electronic copies of the requested governmental records under RSA 91-A:4, V. App.1 at 18. Following an unsuccessful motion for reconsideration, this appeal was filed.

#### SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT

New Hampshire's Right to Know law does not require a public body to provide copies of requested records in electronic format, or whatever format the requesting party chooses. To adopt the Appellant's reading of RSA 91-A:4, V, one must ignore the statute's plain language, and read into the law words that the legislature did not see fit to include by replacing the word "may" with "shall." This interpretation converts the statute from something that, as written, provides a public body with discretion in how it provides access to governmental records, to a directive in which the body is commanded to provide copies of records in the requestor's chosen format. Interpreting the statute in this way is also inconsistent with the express purpose of RSA chapter 91-A, which is to provide citizens with access to governmental records, not to provide copies of records in the requestor's chosen format.

Moreover, the equities here do not mandate that the Appellant be provided electronic copies of the requested records. Unlike the case the Appellant relies upon, Menge v. City of Manchester, 113 N.H. 533 (1973), the Appellees' response to the Appellant's request was reasonable and was not tantamount to a denial of access. Here, the amount of documents that would be generated was fairly modest in number, and there has been no argument that the information contained on paper would be different from that which could be produced electronically. The Appellant's complaint has been simply that she must have the information in electronic format so she could data-mine and manipulate the data.

In the future, should the state legislature choose to require public bodies to provide requested records in electronic or other chosen format, it can amend the law to explicitly state that obligation, as dozens of other states, and the federal government, have done in recent years.

#### **ARGUMENT**

- A. THE SUPERIOR COURT DID NOT ERR IN HOLDING THAT RSA 91-A:4, V DID NOT REQUIRE THE SCHOOL DISTRICT TO PROVIDE THE APPELLANT WITH A COPY OF GOVERNMENTAL RECORDS IN ELECTRONIC FORMAT
  - 1. STANDARD OF REVIEW

"In reviewing a motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim upon which relief may be granted, [the Court] assume[s] the truth of the facts alleged by the plaintiff and construe[s] all reasonable inferences in the light most favorable to the plaintiff." Farm Family Cas. Ins. Co. v. Town of Rollinsford, 155 N.H. 669, 670 (2007). If the facts do not constitute a basis for legal relief, we will uphold the granting of a motion to dismiss. Id. Because the issue presented turns on the interpretation of RSA 91-A:4, V, the Court reviews the superior court's decision *de novo*.

2. NEW HAMPSHIRE'S RIGHT TO KNOW LAW ENSURES THAT CITIZENS HAVE THE RIGHT TO ACCESS GOVERNMENTAL RECORDS AND INFORMATION FOR PURPOSES OF INSPECTION, NOT THAT THEY HAVE THE RIGHT TO COPIES OF SUCH RECORDS OR INFORMATION IN THE FORMAT OF THEIR CHOOSING.

As set forth above, the question presented is whether a public body has the obligation under RSA 91-A:4, V to provide a requesting party with copies of requested record(s) that are stored electronically in electronic format, or another format of his or her choosing. The statute, as written, does not impose such an obligation, and without clear direction from the state legislature, adopting the Appellant's reading would go beyond the express purpose of the law.

The interpretation of the Right-to-Know Law is to be decided ultimately by the Court.

Murray v. N.H. Div. of State Police, 154 N.H. 579, 581 (2006). The Court applies the ordinary rules of statutory construction when reviewing the Right-to-Know Law, and will first look to the plain meaning of the words used. Union Leader Corp. v. City of Nashua, 141 N.H. 473, 475 (1996). Words and phrases are construed according to the common and approved usage of the

language unless from the statute it appears that a different meaning was intended. RSA 21:1, :2 (2000). The Court will construe all parts of a statute together to effectuate its overall purpose and avoid an absurd or unjust result. Zorn v. Demetri, 158 N.H. 437, 438 (2009). Further, when construing a statute, the Court will give effect to all words in the statute and presume that the legislature did not enact superfluous or redundant words. Winnacunnet Co-op. School Dist. v. Town of Seabrook, 148 N.H. 519, 525-26 (2002).

The Appellant does not claim that she was denied access to governmental records, but rather that she was denied electronic copies of requested records. Indeed, the school district fulfilled its statutory obligation by having the requested information available for examination at the school district's office by appointment. See Brent v. Paquette, 132 N.H. 415, 423 (1989) (requiring citizens to arrange a mutually convenient time to examine public records perpetuates the underlying purpose of the statute). The Appellant refused to make an appointment to examine the information, however, and instead insisted on being sent electronic copies of the information via electronic mail.

"The purpose of the Right-to-Know Law is to ensure both the greatest possible public access to the actions, discussions and records of all public bodies, and their accountability to the people." N.H. Civil Liberties Union v. City of Manchester, 149 N.H. 437, 438 (2003) (quotation omitted). Every citizen, therefore, is afforded the right to examine and copy any and all governmental records in the custody, possession or control of a governmental entity. RSA 91-A:4, I. "Governmental Records" are defined as

any information created, accepted, or obtained by, or on behalf of, any public body, or a quorum or majority thereof, or any public agency in furtherance of its official function. Without limiting the foregoing, the term 'governmental records' includes any written communication or other information, whether in paper, electronic, or other physical form, received by a quorum or majority of a public body in furtherance of its official function, whether at a meeting or outside a

meeting of the body. The term 'governmental records' shall also include the term 'public records.'

91-A:1-a, III.

The Appellant's complaint centers on the meaning of RSA 91-A:4, V, which she contends gives her the absolute right to receive electronic copies of requested governmental records. RSA 91-A:4, V provides

In the same manner as set forth in RSA 91-A:4, IV, any public body or agency which maintains governmental records in electronic format may, in lieu of providing original records, copy governmental records requested to electronic media using standard or common file formats in a manner that does not reveal information which is confidential under this chapter or any other law. If copying to electronic media is not reasonably practicable, or if the person or entity requesting access requests a different method, the public body or agency may provide a printout of governmental records requested, or may use any other means reasonably calculated to comply with the request in light of the purpose of this chapter as expressed in RSA 91-A:1. Access to work papers, personnel data, and other confidential information under RSA 91-A:5, IV shall not be provided.

As the statutory section states, 91-A:4, V is intended to be an extension of RSA 91-A:4, IV, which, in pertinent part, states that "[e]ach public body or agency shall, upon request for any governmental record reasonably described, make available for inspection and copying any such governmental record within its files when such records are immediately available for such release." "RSA 91-A:4 does not contain language imposing an absolute duty on towns or agencies to provide copies of public records to citizens. Rather, the statute contemplates that public records be made available to individual members of the public for their inspection and reproduction." Gallagher v. Town of Windham, 121 N.H. 156, 159 (1981). While the statute has been amended since Gallagher, the fundamental obligation of a public agency under the Right to Know Law remains unchanged - "to ensure both the greatest possible public access to the actions, discussions and records of all public bodies, and their accountability to the people."

RSA 91-A:1. Thus, the goal of ensuring access to public records has been, and continues to be the touchstone of RSA 91-A.

The plain language of RSA 91-A:4, V provides the public body with the option to convert original records to electronic format and provide access to those records in that format unless it is either impracticable to convert the record to a computerized format, or the requesting party wants to examine the record in a different format. Importantly, even when considering the second sentence of RSA 91-A:4, V, the public agency is still given discretion to choose what alternate format it will use when providing access to the requested record. When considering whether RSA 91-A:4, V imposes mandatory or discretionary powers, we are guided by this Court's prior statement in North Hampton Racing and Breeding Association, Inc. v. New Hampshire Racing Commission, 94 N.H. 156, 158-59 (1946):

In construing a statute as mandatory or directory, the courts may take into consideration the consequences which would result from construing it as... mandatory. The intention of the Legislature as to the mandatory or directory nature of a particular statutory provision is determined primarily from the language thereof. Words and phrases which are generally regarded as making a provision mandatory include 'shall' and 'must.' On the other hand, a provision couched in permissive terms is generally regarded as directory or discretionary. This is true of the word 'may'...." It is the general rule that in statutes the word 'may' is permissive only, and the word 'shall' is mandatory.

Id. (citations and quotations omitted). Nowhere in the statutory subsection is it mandatory for the public body to provide the requesting party access in the specific manner he or she demands, to say nothing of having to provide copies of requesting governmental records in whatever format is requested. Had the legislature intended such an outcome, it would have used the word "shall" as it has in countless other statutes, including other sections of RSA chapter 91-A. Cf. In the Matter of Bazemore & Jack, 153 N.H. 351, 354 (2006) (general use of "shall" makes provision mandatory).

Examples of mandatory provisions requiring the disclosure of governmental records in the requesting party's chosen format are replete throughout the country. See, e.g. D.C. CODE § 2-532; MINN. STAT. § 13.03; R.I. GEN. LAWS § 38-2-3; VT. STAT. ANN. tit. 1, § 316 (see App.2 at 29, 30-32, 34, 37, 38, 41-42, 44, 47, 50-52, 55, 57-58, 60, 68, 73, 75-76, 78-79, 81, 83, 85). By way of example, below is a list of four (4) state statutes addressing the issue of requiring public bodies to provide governmental records in chosen formats:

#### • The District of Columbia

In making any record available to a person pursuant to this section, a public body shall provide the record in any form or format requested by the person, provided that the person shall pay the costs of reproducing the record in that form or format. D.C. CODE § 2-532. App.2 at 32.

#### Minnesota

The responsible authority of a government entity that maintains public government data in a computer storage medium shall provide to any person making a request under this section a copy of any public data contained in that medium, in electronic form, if the government entity can reasonably make the copy or have a copy made. MINN. STAT. § 13.03. App.2 at 47.

## Rhode Island

Any person or entity requesting copies of public records may elect to obtain them in any and all media in which the public agency is capable of providing them. Any public body which maintains its records in a computer storage system shall provide any data properly identified in a printout or other reasonable format, as requested. R.I. GEN. LAWS § 38-2-3. App.2 at 76.

#### Vermont

If an agency maintains public records in an electronic format, nonexempt public records shall be available for copying in either the standard electronic format or the standard paper format, as designated by the party requesting the records. An agency may, but is not required to, provide copies of public records in

a nonstandard format, to create a public record or to convert paper public records to electronic format. Vt. Stat. Ann. tit. 1, § 316. App.2 at 81.

Given the lack of legislative directive concerning a public body's obligation to provide electronic copies of records in accordance with the requesting party's demands, the Court should hold that RSA 91-A:4,V does not require the public body provide records in electronic format. A party's dictation of format goes beyond the spirit of this state's Right to Know law, which is to provide access to governmental records for the purpose of inspection.

3. THE EQUITIES DO NOT REQUIRE THAT THE APPELLEES PROVIDE THE APPELLANT WITH COPIES OF THE REQUESTED GOVERNMENTAL RECORDS IN ELECTRONIC FORMAT

The Appellant also contends that the Appellees were obligated to provide her with an electronic copy of the requested governmental records under this Court's prior decision of Menge v. City of Manchester, 113 N.H. 533 (1973). In Menge, this Court concluded that a plaintiff had the right to obtain a copy of a computerized tape of 35,000 field record cards that the City used for assessing purposes. That decision was not based upon a statutory mandate, however, but rather on the equitable basis that requiring a party to copy and review 35,000 documents would be far too costly and time-consuming as opposed to providing the information on computer tape. Menge, 113 N.H. at 538.

The Appellant does not deny that the Appellees made the records available to her in a timely manner for her inspection and review, nor that the information contained in the paper copies would be different from that contained in a computer file. Rather, the Appellant's claim appears to be that the Appellees are obligated to provide the records in the format she desires, and by failing to do so have significantly hampered her access to information. Such a claim is unfounded under these circumstances. Unlike Menge, where the party requesting records was faced with the possibility of having to spend countless hours - or more likely days – sifting

through thousands and thousands of pages of data, and spend exorbitant amounts of money for the data, the Appellant's access is unfettered and the cost reasonable. The Appellant initially requested a paper copy of the budget data, and that information would be organized and easily understood. Indeed, as a member of the school district, the Appellant was cognizant of the budget information and the way in which it was catalogued.

The basis for the Appellant's insistence on receiving copies of the budget data in computerized format had nothing to do with reasonable and sufficient access to requested information, and everything to do with assisting the Appellant to "data mine" and "manipulate" the information to suit her personal agenda. Such purposes are not protected by the Right to Know law as it is the message, not the medium, that is at issue.

### CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth in this brief, the superior court's decision should be affirmed.

Respectfully submitted,

SCHOOL ADMINISTRATIVE UNIT #55, EARL F. METZLER, II, TIMBERLANE REGIONAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, AND NANCY STEENSON

By Their Counsel,

DRUMMOND WOODSUM & MacMAHON

By:

Date: 11/4/15

Matthew R. Serge NHBA# 14243 Anna B. Cole NHBA# 20667 1001 Elm Street, Suite 303 Manchester, N.H. 03101-1845

(603) 716-2895

## REQUEST FOR ORAL ARGUMENT

If the Court determines that oral argument shall be held, the Appellees respectfully requests the opportunity to present oral argument, not to exceed 15 minutes, to be presented by Matthew R. Serge, Esquire.

Matthew R. Serge

## **CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

I hereby certify that the foregoing Brief conforms with the Supreme Court Rule 26(2), (3) and (4).

Matthew R. Serge

# **CERTIFICATION**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing was this day forwarded to Richard Lehman, Esquire, opposing counsel of record.

Matthew R. Serge

## STATE OF NEW HAMPSHIRE

### SUPREME COURT

## **2015 TERM**

November

## No. 2015-0274

## **DONNA M. GREEN**

 $\mathbf{v}_{\bullet}$ 

# SCHOOL ADMINISTRATIVE UNIT #55, EARL F. METZLER, II, TIMBERLANE REGIONAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, AND NANCY STEENSON

## TABLE OF CONTENTS FOR APPENDIX TO BRIEF FOR APPELLEES

	Document	Page
1.	E-mail from Earl Metzler to Donna Green, dated July 24, 2014	15
2.	Verified Motion to Dismiss	16
3.	Collection of right to know laws from states outside New Hampshire	23



## Report

Metzler, Earl < Earl. Metzler@timberlane.net>

Thu, Jul 24, 2014 at 6:14 PM

To: Donna Green <donnagre@gmail.com>

Cc: Nancy Steenson <nancysteenson@comcast.net>, "Belcher, Catherine" <Catherine.Belcher@timberlane.net>

Mrs Green - Today it was reported to me that you were both disrespectful and harassing to several employees. Of course I will investigate this report and if validated I will need to limit your access to the SAU. This is both disturbing and unfortunate. I will also be consulting with both the Plaistow Police Department and district council.

Respectfully,

Dr. Earl F. Metzler II

winmail.dat

## STATE OF NEW HAMPSHIRE

ROCKINGHAM, SS

SUPERIOR COURT

Donna M. Green

٧.

School Administrative Unit #55, et al

No. 218-2015-CV-00090

## **VERIFIED MOTION TO DISMISS**

COMES NOW Defendants, Timberlane Regional School District, SAU #55, Dr. Earl F. Metzler II and Nancy Steenson, represented by Jeanne M. Kincaid of Drummond Woodsum, and files this motion to dismiss. Plaintiff Donna M. Green's Complaint is based upon alleged violations of RSA Chapter 91-A (hereafter referred to as New Hampshire's "Right-to-Know law").

# I. COUNT ONE - ALLEGED VIOLATION OF RSA 91-A:4, I AND IV A. Factual Background

Plaintiff's first allegation does not suggest that the Defendants failed to timely make governmental records available for her inspection and review. Rather, Plaintiff appears to be asserting that Defendants are obligated to provide documents in the format she wishes, in this instance, via electronic format and delivery.

On January 21, 2015, Plaintiff filed a request for copies of public documents with Defendant Nancy Steenson. See Complaint ¶5.¹ Plaintiff serves on the Timberlane Regional School Board (hereafter referred to as "TRSB"). See Complaint ¶1. Defendant Steenson serves as the Chair of TRSB. See Complaint ¶3. In Plaintiff's initial email request, she did not indicate that her request for information was being made pursuant to RSA 91-A:4, rather than as a school

<sup>1</sup> In this section, referenced paragraphs pertain to Count One of Plaintiff's Complaint.

board member seeking information from the TRSB Chair. See Complaint §5. Indeed, Plaintiff's request is to provide her "and the school board" with certain documents. Accordingly, Defendant Steenson replied in kind to Plaintiff via email suggesting that if "copies" were to be made for all the school board members, then Plaintiff should ask the board to weigh in on her request. See Complaint §6. Furthermore, Plaintiff acknowledges to the Court that "the original request was not a formal Right to Know Request . . " See Plaintiff's Argument, page 7, §7.

On January 23, 2015, Plaintiff clarified that she was making her request pursuant to RSA 91-A:4. See Complaint ¶7. On January 26, 2015, Ms. Cathy Belcher, an Executive Assistant to Defendant SAU #55 Superintendent Dr. Earl F. Metzler II, sent Plaintiff an email informing her that the requested information was available for her inspection and review, but requested the courtesy of making an appointment. See Complaint ¶14. After receiving a reply, Ms. Belcher again wrote to Plaintiff on January 29, 2015 informing her that the information requested was "immediately available for public inspection." See Complaint ¶16.

### B. Argument

RSA 91-A:4 authorizes the citizenry "the right to inspect ... and to copy" governmental records. However, this right to inspect and copy is limited to "the regular or business hours . . . and on the regular business premises" of said public body. *Id.* Asking the requester to schedule the inspection at a mutually agreeable time does not violate RSA 91-A:4. *See Brent v. Paquette*, 132 N.H. 415, 422, 567 A.2d 976, 980 (1989).

Furthermore, the Right-to-Know law lacks any provision requiring a public body to produce documents in an electronic format. Indeed, RSA 91-A:4, VII expressly disavows such an obligation.

Nothing in this chapter shall be construed to require a public body or agency to compile, cross-reference, or assemble information into a form in which it is not already kept or reported by that body or agency.

See Hawkins v. New Hampshire Dept. of Health and Human Serv., 147 N.H. 376, 379, 788 A2d 255, 258 (2001) ("RSA Chapter 91-A does not require HHS to compile data into a format specifically requested by a person seeking information under the statute.") See also Nolen v. City of Keene, Cheshire Cty. Sup. Ct. (09-E-0152) (Arnold J., November 23, 2009)

(denying demand for records to be sent via email; "as long as the records are made available for inspection and copying, a public body or agency has satisfied its duties under the statute"). This view is support by the New Hampshire Attorney General's Office. See Right to Know Memorandum, at page 37. RSA 91-A:4, V permits in certain circumstances complying with a request via copying electronic records. However, the provision does not require a governmental body to reproduce records in an electronic format.

Plaintiff Green does not deny that the Defendants made the records available to her in a timely manner for her inspection and review. Rather, Plaintiff's claim appears to be that Defendants are obligated to provide the records in the format she desires, but cites no authority for such a proposition.

# II. COUNT TWO - ALLEGED VIOLATION OF RSA 91-A:4, I AND IV A. Factual Background

In Count Two, Plaintiff appears to be asserting that Defendants violated the Right-to-Know law by failing to release upon demand a copy of a videotape made by its security cameras. As the Complaint supports, on July 24, 2014, Plaintiff admits that she had a verbal disagreement with Ms. Belcher at the SAU #55 offices. See Complaint ¶1.3 On July 25, 2014, Defendant Metzler notified Plaintiff that given her disrespectful and harassing conduct of SAU employees, he would be conducting an investigation and consulting with the Plaistow Police Department. See Complaint ¶3.

Although Plaintiff requested a copy of the surveillance tape, the Defendants informed her that the Police Department had advised them not to release the tape while they investigated the matter. See Complaint ¶6. Plaintiff's representation is supported by a letter dated August 4, 2014 from Defendant Metzler to the Plaistow Police Department. See Plaintiff's Exhibit #2. Accordingly, the Defendants were under a law enforcement directive not to release a copy of the video surveillance tape until the police had an opportunity to investigate the matter. In fact, Plaintiff Green's failure to respond to the police department's inquiry delayed the investigation. See Defendants' Exhibit #1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Available at: http://doj.nh.gov/civil/documents/right-to-know.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In this section, referenced paragraphs pertain to Count Two of Plaintiff's Complaint, beginning at page 8.

As of August 25, 2014, the Plaistow Police Department had an open investigation. See Plaintiff's Exhibit #1. Defendant Metzler informed Plaintiff to contact the police department to make inquiry as to the availability of inspecting and obtaining a copy of the tape. Id. On September 24, 2014, Ms. Belcher sent an email to the police department to confirm that they were now authorizing school officials to release a copy of the video recording. See Defendants' Exhibit #2. On September 25, 2014, the police department confirmed the authorization. Id. On September 26, 2014, Defendant SAU #55 provided Plaintiff with a copy of the videotape. See Complaint ¶9.

### B. Argument

Defendants do not dispute that a videotape recording may be subject to RSA 91-A. See RSA 91-A:4, I. However, the New Hampshire Supreme Court has exempted investigatory documents for law enforcement purposes from disclosure. See Murray v. State Police, 154 N.H. 579, 913 A.2d 737 (2006). To qualify for such an exemption, proceedings do not have to be pending or even imminent. See Murray v. State Police (Murray II), No. 2007-0459, at 1 (Supreme Court Order, April 16, 2008).

The "Murray exemption" is based on language contained in the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7), and authorizes law enforcement records to be exempt from disclosure for any one of six reasons. One justification is for records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes to the extent that the production of such law enforcement records or information "could reasonably be expected to interfere with enforcement proceedings."

Although the *Murray* exemption expressly applies to law enforcement authorities, the New Hampshire Supreme Court has expanded its reach to other governmental bodies working with law enforcement. In 38 Endicott Street North, 163 N.H. 656, 44 A.3d 571 (2012), the Court applied the interference with enforcement proceedings *Murray* exemption to a request for records from a fire department which had been working with law enforcement in the investigation of a possible crime.

Defendant Metzler notified Plaintiff the same day as the harassing incident occurred that he would be notifying the police department. The police, in turn, directed Defendant Metzler not to release a copy of the video surveillance tape until the police had an opportunity to investigate the matter, which they made known to Plaintiff. See Plaintiff's Exhibit #2 (August 4, 2014 correspondence from Dr. Metzler to Lieutenant Baldwin; page 2 of September 18, 2014 correspondence from Attorney Lehmann to Defendant Metzler (acknowledging that Ms. Belcher had notified Plaintiff that videotape would not be released). The Defendants promptly released the video once the police department authorized them to do so. Accordingly, Plaintiff's claim fails under the Right-to-Know law.

Secondly, the claim is moot. Plaintiff does not dispute that Defendants provided her with a copy of the videotape in question.

### III. Plaintiff Has No Right to Attorney Fees

Plaintiff should be awarded no remedy as her claims lack merit. To be eligible for attorney fees, Plaintiff must first demonstrate that the school district "knew or should have known that the conduct engaged in was in violation of this chapter . . ." RSA 91-A:8, I. Since Plaintiff cannot establish a violation, let alone actual or imputed knowledge, her claim fails.

Second, Plaintiff has incurred no fees in this action as she is appearing pro se. The statute only authorizes a remedy for reasonable attorney's fees and costs "incurred in a lawsuit under this chapter . . ." *Id.* Given that Plaintiff has incurred no attorney's fees in this lawsuit prosecution, she is not entitled to any such award, regardless of the merits of her underlying claims.

Third, count II is moot. Accordingly, initiating this lawsuit was not "necessary in order to enforce compliance", one of the conditions in which attorney fee's could be awarded. *Id*.

Finally, Plaintiff's request for attorney fees is admittedly related to her securing an attorney to seek a lifting of what she deems a "no trespass order", see Complaint ¶8, a claim that the Right-to-Know law does not regulate in any manner.

#### Conclusion

Plaintiff has failed to establish that any Defendant has violated the Right-to-Know law. Accordingly, her claim should be dismissed with prejudice.

Respectfully submitted,

March 4, 2015

By:

Drummond Woodsum

100 International Drive, Suite 340

Portsmouth, NH 03801 603-433-3317, ext. 203 Jkincaid@dwmlaw.com

### **VERIFICATION**

I, Dr. Earl f. Metzler II, in my capacity as Superintendent of SAU 55, being duly sworn, verify that the attestations set forth in the foregoing Motion to Dismiss are true to the best of my knowledge and belief.

STATE OF NEW HAMPSHIRE

COUNTY OF ROCKINGHAM, ss

On this 4th day of March, 2015, before me, personally appeared Dr. Earl F. Metzler II, known to me or satisfactorily proven to be the person whose name is subscribed to the within instrument and acknowledged that he executed the same for the purposes therein contained.

Printed Name: Heather 7

My Commission expires: 10/2

HEATHER DEGNAN unissioner of Deeds - New Hampshire My Commission Expires October 29, 2019

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this date set forth above to Donna M. Green.	pleading has been for	warded postage	prepaid, on the
date set forth above to Donna M. Green.	170	1/00	

Jeanne M. Kincaid, Esq.

## STATUTORY APPENDIX TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Arkansas25
II.	California
III.	Connecticut
IV.	District of Columbia
V.	Florida 34
VI.	Georgia35
VII.	Illinois
VIII.	Iowa40
IX.	Kentucky42
X.	Maryland
XI.	Minnesota
XII.	Mississippi50
XIII.	Missouri51
XIV.	Nebraska
XV.	New Jersey54
XVI.	New Mexico
XVII.	North Carolina
XVIII.	North Dakota
XIX.	Ohio
XX.	Oregon
XXI.	Pennsylvania
XXII.	Rhode Island

XXIII. South Carolina	78
XXIV. Texas	79
XXV. Vermont	80
XXVI. Virginia	82
XXVII. West Virginia	85

## I. <u>Arkansas</u> – Ark. Code Ann. § 25-19-105

## § 25-19-105. Examination and copying of public records--Exceptions

- (a)(1)(A) Except as otherwise specifically provided by this section or by laws specifically enacted to provide otherwise, all public records shall be open to inspection and copying by any citizen of the State of Arkansas during the regular business hours of the custodian of the records.
  - (B) However, access to inspect and copy public records shall be denied to:
    - (i) A person who at the time of the request has pleaded guilty to or been found guilty of a felony and is incarcerated in a correctional facility; and
    - (ii) The representative of a person under subdivision (a)(1)(B)(i) of this section unless the representative is the person's attorney who is requesting information that is subject to disclosure under this section.
  - (2)(A) A citizen may make a request to the custodian to inspect, copy, or receive copies of public records.
    - (B) The request may be made in person, by telephone, by mail, by facsimile transmission, by electronic mail, or by other electronic means provided by the custodian.
    - (C) The request shall be sufficiently specific to enable the custodian to locate the records with reasonable effort.
  - (3) If the person to whom the request is directed is not the custodian of the records, the person shall so notify the requester and identify the custodian, if known to or readily ascertainable by the person.
- (b) It is the specific intent of this section that the following shall not be deemed to be made open to the public under the provisions of this chapter:
  - (1) State income tax records:
  - (2) Medical records, adoption records, and education records as defined in the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974, 20 U.S.C. § 1232g, unless their disclosure is consistent with the provisions of that act:
  - (3) The site files and records maintained by the Arkansas Historic Preservation Program of the Department of Arkansas Heritage and the Arkansas Archeological Survey;
  - (4) Grand jury minutes;
  - (5) Unpublished drafts of judicial or quasi-judicial opinions and decisions;
  - (6) Undisclosed investigations by law enforcement agencies of suspected criminal activity;
  - (7) Unpublished memoranda, working papers, and correspondence of the Governor, members of the General Assembly, Supreme Court Justices, Court of Appeals Judges, and the Attorney General;
  - (8) Documents that are protected from disclosure by order or rule of court;
  - (9)(A) Files that if disclosed would give advantage to competitors or bidders; and
    - (B)(i) Records maintained by the Arkansas Economic Development Commission related to any business entity's planning, site location, expansion, operations, or product

development and marketing, unless approval for release of those records is granted by the business entity.

- (ii) However, this exemption shall not be applicable to any records of expenditures or grants made or administered by the commission and otherwise disclosable under the provisions of this chapter;
- (10)(A) The identities of law enforcement officers currently working undercover with their agencies and identified in the Arkansas Minimum Standards Office as undercover officers.
  - (B) Records of the number of undercover officers and agency lists are not exempt from this chapter;
- (11) Records containing measures, procedures, instructions, or related data used to cause a computer or a computer system or network, including telecommunication networks or applications thereon, to perform security functions, including, but not limited to, passwords, personal identification numbers, transaction authorization mechanisms, and other means of preventing access to computers, computer systems or networks, or any data residing therein;
- (12) Personnel records to the extent that disclosure would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy;
- (13) Personal contact information, including without limitation home or mobile telephone numbers, personal email addresses, and home addresses of nonelected state employees, nonelected municipal employees, nonelected school employees, and nonelected county employees contained in employer records, except that the custodian of the records shall verify an employee's city or county of residence or address on record upon request;
- (14) Materials, information, examinations, and answers to examinations utilized by boards and commissions for purposes of testing applicants for licensure by state boards or commissions;
- (15) Military service discharge records or DD Form 214, the Certificate of Release or Discharge from Active Duty of the United States Department of Defense, filed with the county recorder as provided under § 14-2-102, for veterans discharged from service less than seventy (70) years from the current date;
- (16) Vulnerability assessments submitted by a public water system on or before June 30, 2004, to the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency for a period of ten (10) years from the date of submission;
- (17)(A) Records, including analyses, investigations, studies, reports, or recommendations, containing information relating to any Department of Human Services risk or security assessment, known or suspected security vulnerability, or safeguard related to compliance with the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 19961 or protection of other confidential department information.
  - (B) The records shall include:
    - (i) Risk and security assessments;
    - (ii) Plans and proposals for preventing and mitigating privacy and security risks;
    - (iii) Emergency response and recovery records;
    - (iv) Privacy and security plans and procedures; and

- (v) Any other records containing information that if disclosed might jeopardize or compromise efforts to secure and protect personal health information or other protected department information.
- (C) This subdivision (b)(17) expires on July 1, 2009;
- (18)(A) Records, including analyses, investigations, studies, reports, recommendations, requests for proposals, drawings, diagrams, blueprints, and plans containing information relating to security for any public water system or municipally owned utility system.
  - (B) The records under subdivision (b)(18)(A) include:
    - (i) Risk and vulnerability assessments;
    - (ii) Plans and proposals for preventing and mitigating security risks;
    - (iii) Emergency response and recovery records;
    - (iv) Security plans and procedures;
    - (v) Plans and related information for generation, transmission, and distribution systems; and
    - (vi) Other records containing information that if disclosed might jeopardize or compromise efforts to secure and protect the public water system or municipally owned utility system;
- (19) Records pertaining to the issuance, renewal, expiration, suspension, or revocation of a license to carry a concealed handgun, or a present or past licensee under § 5-73-301 et seq., including without limitation all records provided to or obtained by a local, state, or federal government or their officials, agents, or employees in the investigation of an applicant, licensee, or past licensee, and all records pertaining to a criminal or health history check conducted on the applicant, licensee, or past licensee except that:
  - (A) Information or other records regarding an applicant, licensee, or past licensee may be released to a law enforcement agency to assist in a criminal investigation or prosecution or to determine the validity of or eligibility for a license; and
  - (B) The name of an applicant, licensee, or past licensee may be released as contained in investigative or arrest reports of law enforcement that are subject to release as public records; and
    - <Text of (b)(20) as added by Acts of 2015, Act 186, § 3.>
- (20) Personal information of current and former public water system customers and municipally owned utility system customers, including without limitation:
  - (A) Home and mobile telephone numbers;
  - (B) Personal email addresses;
  - (C) Home and business addressees; and
  - (D) Customer usage data.

<Text of (b)(20) as added by Acts of 2015, Act 1102, § 1.>

- (20)(A) Information related to taxes collected by particular entities under § 26-74-501 et seq.; the Advertising and Promotion Commission Act, § 26-75-601 et seq.; and § 26-75-701 et seq.
  - (B) However, this exemption does not apply to information or other records regarding the total taxes collected under § 26-74-501 et seq.; the Advertising and Promotion Commission Act, § 26-75-601 et seq.; and § 26-75-701 et seq. in the county or municipality as a whole.

<Text of (b)(20) as added by Acts of 2015, Act 1015, § 1.>

(20) The date of birth, home address, email address, phone number, and other contact information from county or municipal parks and recreation department records of a person who was under eighteen (18) years of age at the time of the request made under this section.

<Text of (b)(20) as added by Acts of 2015, Act 881, § 2.>

- (20) Electronic data information maintained by a disaster recovery system.
- (c)(1) Notwithstanding subdivision (b)(12) of this section, all employee evaluation or job performance records, including preliminary notes and other materials, shall be open to public inspection only upon final administrative resolution of any suspension or termination proceeding at which the records form a basis for the decision to suspend or terminate the employee and if there is a compelling public interest in their disclosure.
  - (2) Any personnel or evaluation records exempt from disclosure under this chapter shall nonetheless be made available to the person about whom the records are maintained or to that person's designated representative.
  - (3)(A) Upon receiving a request for the examination or copying of personnel or evaluation records, the custodian of the records shall determine within twenty-four (24) hours of the receipt of the request whether the records are exempt from disclosure and make efforts to the fullest extent possible to notify the person making the request and the subject of the records of that decision.
    - (B)(i) If the subject of the records cannot be contacted in person or by telephone within the twenty-four-hour period, the custodian shall send written notice via overnight mail to the subject of the records at his or her last known address. Either the custodian, requester, or the subject of the records may immediately seek an opinion from the Attorney General, who, within three (3) working days of receipt of the request, shall issue an opinion stating whether the decision is consistent with this chapter.
      - (ii) In the event of a review by the Attorney General, the custodian shall not disclose the records until the Attorney General has issued his or her opinion.
  - (C) However, nothing in this subsection shall be construed to prevent the requester or the subject of the records from seeking judicial review of the custodian's decision or the decision of the Attorney General.
- (d)(1) Reasonable access to public records and reasonable comforts and facilities for the full exercise of the right to inspect and copy those records shall not be denied to any citizen.
  - (2)(A) Upon request and payment of a fee as provided in subdivision (d)(3) of this section, the custodian shall furnish copies of public records if the custodian has the necessary duplicating equipment.

- (B) A citizen may request a copy of a public record in any medium in which the record is readily available or in any format to which it is readily convertible with the custodian's existing software.
- (C) A custodian is not required to compile information or create a record in response to a request made under this section.
- (3)(A)(i) Except as provided in § 25-19-109 or by law, any fee for copies shall not exceed the actual costs of reproduction, including the costs of the medium of reproduction, supplies, equipment, and maintenance, but not including existing agency personnel time associated with searching for, retrieving, reviewing, or copying the records.
  - (ii) The custodian may also charge the actual costs of mailing or transmitting the record by facsimile or other electronic means.
  - (iii) If the estimated fee exceeds twenty-five dollars (\$25.00), the custodian may require the requester to pay that fee in advance.
  - (iv) Copies may be furnished without charge or at a reduced charge if the custodian determines that the records have been requested primarily for noncommercial purposes and that waiver or reduction of the fee is in the public interest.
  - (B) The custodian shall provide an itemized breakdown of charges under subdivision (d)(3)(A) of this section.
- (e) If a public record is in active use or storage and therefore not available at the time a citizen asks to examine it, the custodian shall certify this fact in writing to the applicant and set a date and hour within three (3) working days at which time the record will be available for the exercise of the right given by this chapter.
- (f)(1) No request to inspect, copy, or obtain copies of public records shall be denied on the ground that information exempt from disclosure is commingled with nonexempt information.
  - (2) Any reasonably segregable portion of a record shall be provided after deletion of the exempt information.
  - (3) The amount of information deleted shall be indicated on the released portion of the record and, if technically feasible, at the place in the record where the deletion was made.
  - (4) If it is necessary to separate exempt from nonexempt information in order to permit a citizen to inspect, copy, or obtain copies of public records, the custodian shall bear the cost of the separation.
- (g) Any computer hardware or software acquired by an entity subject to § 25-19-103(5)(A) after July 1, 2001, shall be in full compliance with the requirements of this section and shall not impede public access to records in electronic form.
- (h) Notwithstanding any Arkansas law to the contrary, at the conclusion of any investigation conducted by a state agency in pursuit of civil penalties against the subject of the investigation, any settlement agreement entered into by a state agency shall be deemed a public document for the purposes of this chapter. However, the provisions of this subsection shall not apply to any investigation or settlement agreement involving any state tax covered by the Arkansas Tax Procedure Act, § 26-18-101 et seq.

## II. California – CAL. GOV'T CODE § 6253.9

## § 6253.9. Information in an electronic format; costs; application; availability

- (a) Unless otherwise prohibited by law, any agency that has information that constitutes an identifiable public record not exempt from disclosure pursuant to this chapter that is in an electronic format shall make that information available in an electronic format when requested by any person and, when applicable, shall comply with the following:
  - (1) The agency shall make the information available in any electronic format in which it holds the information.
  - (2) Each agency shall provide a copy of an electronic record in the format requested if the requested format is one that has been used by the agency to create copies for its own use or for provision to other agencies. The cost of duplication shall be limited to the direct cost of producing a copy of a record in an electronic format.
- (b) Notwithstanding paragraph (2) of subdivision (a), the requester shall bear the cost of producing a copy of the record, including the cost to construct a record, and the cost of programming and computer services necessary to produce a copy of the record when either of the following applies:
  - (1) In order to comply with the provisions of subdivision (a), the public agency would be required to produce a copy of an electronic record and the record is one that is produced only at otherwise regularly scheduled intervals.
  - (2) The request would require data compilation, extraction, or programming to produce the record.
- (c) Nothing in this section shall be construed to require the public agency to reconstruct a record in an electronic format if the agency no longer has the record available in an electronic format.
- (d) If the request is for information in other than electronic format, and the information also is in electronic format, the agency may inform the requester that the information is available in electronic format.
- (e) Nothing in this section shall be construed to permit an agency to make information available only in an electronic format.
- (f) Nothing in this section shall be construed to require the public agency to release an electronic record in the electronic form in which it is held by the agency if its release would jeopardize or compromise the security or integrity of the original record or of any proprietary software in which it is maintained.
- (g) Nothing in this section shall be construed to permit public access to records held by any agency to which access is otherwise restricted by statute.

## III. Connecticut – CONN. GEN. STAT. § 1-211

- § 1-211. Disclosure of computer-stored public records. Contracts. Acquisition of system, equipment, software to store or retrieve nonexempt public records
- (a) Any public agency which maintains public records in a computer storage system shall provide, to any person making a request pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act, a copy of any nonexempt data contained in such records, properly identified, on paper, disk, tape or any other electronic storage device or medium requested by the person, including an electronic copy sent to the electronic mail address of the person making such request, if the agency can reasonably make any such copy or have any such copy made. Except as otherwise provided by state statute, the cost for providing a copy of such data shall be in accordance with the provisions of section 1-212.
- (b) Except as otherwise provided by state statute, no public agency shall enter into a contract with, or otherwise obligate itself to, any person if such contract or obligation impairs the right of the public under the Freedom of Information Act to inspect or copy the agency's nonexempt public records existing on-line in, or stored on a device or medium used in connection with, a computer system owned, leased or otherwise used by the agency in the course of its governmental functions.
- (c) On and after July 1, 1992, before any public agency acquires any computer system, equipment or software to store or retrieve nonexempt public records, it shall consider whether such proposed system, equipment or software adequately provides for the rights of the public under the Freedom of Information Act at the least cost possible to the agency and to persons entitled to access to nonexempt public records under the Freedom of Information Act. In meeting its obligations under this subsection, each state public agency shall consult with the Department of Administrative Services as part of the agency's design analysis prior to acquiring any such computer system, equipment or software. The Department of Administrative Services shall adopt written guidelines to assist municipal agencies in carrying out the purposes of this subsection. Nothing in this subsection shall require an agency to consult with said department prior to acquiring a system, equipment or software or modifying software, if such acquisition or modification is consistent with a design analysis for which such agency has previously consulted with said department. The Department of Administrative Services shall consult with the Freedom of Information Commission on matters relating to access to and disclosure of public records for the purposes of this subsection. The provisions of this subsection shall not apply to software modifications which would not affect the rights of the public under the Freedom of Information Act.

## IV. <u>District of Columbia</u> – D.C. CODE § 2-532

## § 2-532. Right of access to public records; allowable costs; time limits.

- (a) Any person has a right to inspect, and at his or her discretion, to copy any public record of a public body, except as otherwise expressly provided by § 2-534, in accordance with reasonable rules that shall be issued by a public body after notice and comment, concerning the time and place of access.
  - (a-1) In making any record available to a person pursuant to this section, a public body shall provide the record in any form or format requested by the person, provided that the person shall pay the costs of reproducing the record in that form or format.
  - (a-2) In responding to a request for records pursuant to this section, a public body shall make reasonable efforts to search for the records in electronic form or format, except when the efforts would significantly interfere with the operation of the public body's automated information system.
  - (a-3) A public body shall make available for inspection and copying any record produced or collected pursuant to a contract with a private contractor to perform a public function, and the public body with programmatic responsibility for the contractor shall be responsible for making such records available to the same extent as if the record were maintained by the public body.
- (b) A public body may establish and collect fees not to exceed the actual cost of searching for, reviewing, and making copies of records. Documents may be furnished without charge or at a reduced charge where a public body determines that waiver or reduction of the fee is in the public interest because furnishing the information can be considered as primarily benefiting the general public.
  - (b-1) Any fee schedules adopted by the Mayor, an agency or a public body shall provide that:
    - (1) Fees shall be limited to reasonable standard charges for document search, duplication, and review when records are requested for commercial use;
    - (2) Fees shall be limited to reasonable standard charges for document duplication when records are not sought for commercial use and the request is made by an educational or non-commercial scientific institution for scholarly or scientific research, or a representative of the news media;
    - (3) For any request for records not described in paragraphs (1) or (2) of this subsection, fees shall be limited to reasonable standard charges for document search and duplication; and
    - (4) Only the direct costs of search, duplication, or review may be recovered.
  - (b-2) Review costs shall include only the direct costs incurred during the initial examination of a document to determine whether the documents must be disclosed or withheld in part as exempt under this section. Review costs may not include costs incurred to determine issues of law or policy related to the request.

- (b-3) No agency or public body may require advance payment of any fee unless the requester has previously failed to pay fees in a timely fashion, or the agency or public body has determined that the fee will exceed \$250.
- (c) A public body, upon request reasonably describing any public record, shall within 15 days (except Saturdays, Sundays, and legal public holidays) of the receipt of any such request either make the requested public record accessible or notify the person making such request of its determination not to make the requested public record or any part thereof accessible and the reasons therefor.
- (d) In unusual circumstances, the time limit prescribed in subsection (c) of this section may be extended by written notice to the person making such request setting forth the reasons for extension and expected date for determination. Such extension shall not exceed 10 days (except Saturdays, Sundays, and legal public holidays). For purposes of this subsection, and only to the extent necessary for processing of the particular request, "unusual circumstances" are limited to:
  - (1) The need to search for, collect, and appropriately examine a voluminous amount of separate and distinct records which are demanded in a single request; or
  - (2) The need for consultation, which shall be conducted with all practicable speed, with another public body having a substantial interest in the determination of the request or among 2 or more components of a public body having substantial subject-matter interest therein.
- (e) Any failure on the part of a public body to comply with a request under subsection (a) of this section within the time provisions of subsections (c) and (d) of this section shall be deemed a denial of the request, and the person making such request shall be deemed to have exhausted his administrative remedies with respect to such request, unless such person chooses to petition the Mayor pursuant to § 2-537 to review the deemed denial of the request.
- (f) For purposes of this section, the term:
  - (1) "Reasonable efforts" means that a public body shall not be required to expend more than 8 hours of personnel time to reprogram or reformat records.
  - (1A) "Request" means a single demand for any number of documents made at one time to an individual public body.
  - (2) "Search" means to review manually or by automated means, public records for the purpose of locating those records which are responsive to a request.

### V. <u>Florida</u> – Fla. Stat. § 119.01

#### 119.01. General state policy on public records

- (1) It is the policy of this state that all state, county, and municipal records are open for personal inspection and copying by any person. Providing access to public records is a duty of each agency.
- (2)(a) Automation of public records must not erode the right of access to those records. As each agency increases its use of and dependence on electronic recordkeeping, each agency must provide reasonable public access to records electronically maintained and must ensure that exempt or confidential records are not disclosed except as otherwise permitted by law.
  - (b) When designing or acquiring an electronic recordkeeping system, an agency must consider whether such system is capable of providing data in some common format such as, but not limited to, the American Standard Code for Information Interchange.
  - (c) An agency may not enter into a contract for the creation or maintenance of a public records database if that contract impairs the ability of the public to inspect or copy the public records of the agency, including public records that are online or stored in an electronic recordkeeping system used by the agency.
  - (d) Subject to the restrictions of copyright and trade secret laws and public records exemptions, agency use of proprietary software must not diminish the right of the public to inspect and copy a public record.
  - (e) Providing access to public records by remote electronic means is an additional method of access that agencies should strive to provide to the extent feasible. If an agency provides access to public records by remote electronic means, such access should be provided in the most cost-effective and efficient manner available to the agency providing the information.
  - (f) Each agency that maintains a public record in an electronic recordkeeping system shall provide to any person, pursuant to this chapter, a copy of any public record in that system which is not exempted by law from public disclosure. An agency must provide a copy of the record in the medium requested if the agency maintains the record in that medium, and the agency may charge a fee in accordance with this chapter. For the purpose of satisfying a public records request, the fee to be charged by an agency if it elects to provide a copy of a public record in a medium not routinely used by the agency, or if it elects to compile information not routinely developed or maintained by the agency or that requires a substantial amount of manipulation or programming, must be in accordance with s. 119.07(4).
- (3) If public funds are expended by an agency in payment of dues or membership contributions for any person, corporation, foundation, trust, association, group, or other organization, all the financial, business, and membership records of that person, corporation, foundation, trust, association, group, or other organization which pertain to the public agency are public records and subject to the provisions of s. 119.07.

#### VI. <u>Georgia</u> – GA. CODE ANN. § 50-18-71

# § 50-18-71. Inspection and copies of public records; request procedures; fees and charges

- (a) All public records shall be open for personal inspection and copying, except those which by order of a court of this state or by law are specifically exempted from disclosure. Records shall be maintained by agencies to the extent and in the manner required by Article 5 of this chapter.
- (b)(1)(A) Agencies shall produce for inspection all records responsive to a request within a reasonable amount of time not to exceed three business days of receipt of a request; provided, however, that nothing in this chapter shall require agencies to produce records in response to a request if such records did not exist at the time of the request. In those instances where some, but not all, records are available within three business days, an agency shall make available within that period those records that can be located and produced. In any instance where records are unavailable within three business days of receipt of the request, and responsive records exist, the agency shall, within such time period, provide the requester with a description of such records and a timeline for when the records will be available for inspection or copying and provide the responsive records or access thereto as soon as practicable.
  - (B) A request made pursuant to this article may be made to the custodian of a public record orally or in writing. An agency may, but shall not be obligated to, require that all written requests be made upon the responder's choice of one of the following: the agency's director, chairperson, or chief executive officer, however denominated; the senior official at any satellite office of an agency; a clerk specifically designated by an agency as the custodian of agency records; or a duly designated open records officer of an agency; provided, however, that the absence or unavailability of the designated agency officer or employee shall not be permitted to delay the agency's response. At the time of inspection, any person may make photographic copies or other electronic reproductions of the records using suitable portable devices brought to the place of inspection. Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, an agency may, in its discretion, provide copies of a record in lieu of providing access to the record when portions of the record contain confidential information that must be redacted.
  - (2) Any agency that designates one or more open records officers upon whom requests for inspection or copying of records may be delivered shall make such designation in writing and shall immediately provide notice to any person upon request, orally or in writing, of those open records officers. If the agency has elected to designate an open records officer, the agency shall so notify the legal organ of the county in which the agency's principal offices reside and, if the agency has a website, shall also prominently display such designation on the agency's website. In the event an agency requires that requests be made upon the individuals identified in subparagraph (B) of paragraph (1) of this subsection, the three-day period for response to a written request shall not begin to run until the request is made in writing upon such individuals. An agency shall permit receipt of written requests by e-mail or facsimile transmission in addition to any other methods of transmission approved by the agency, provided such agency uses e-mail or facsimile in the normal course of its business.
  - (3) The enforcement provisions of Code Sections 50-18-73 and 50-18-74 shall be available only to enforce compliance and punish noncompliance when a written request is made consistent with this subsection and shall not be available when such request is made orally.

- (c)(1) An agency may impose a reasonable charge for the search, retrieval, redaction, and production or copying costs for the production of records pursuant to this article. An agency shall utilize the most economical means reasonably calculated to identify and produce responsive, nonexcluded documents. Where fees for certified copies or other copies or records are specifically authorized or otherwise prescribed by law, such specific fee shall apply when certified copies or other records to which a specific fee may apply are sought. In all other instances, the charge for the search, retrieval, or redaction of records shall not exceed the prorated hourly salary of the lowest paid full-time employee who, in the reasonable discretion of the custodian of the records, has the necessary skill and training to perform the request; provided, however, that no charge shall be made for the first quarter hour.
  - (2) In addition to a charge for the search, retrieval, or redaction of records, an agency may charge a fee for the copying of records or data, not to exceed 10¢ per page for letter or legal size documents or, in the case of other documents, the actual cost of producing the copy. In the case of electronic records, the agency may charge the actual cost of the media on which the records or data are produced.
  - (3) Whenever any person has requested to inspect or copy a public record and does not pay the cost for search, retrieval, redaction, or copying of such records when such charges have been lawfully estimated and agreed to pursuant to this article, and the agency has incurred the agreed-upon costs to make the records available, regardless of whether the requester inspects or accepts copies of the records, the agency shall be authorized to collect such charges in any manner authorized by law for the collection of taxes, fees, or assessments by such agency.
- (d) In any instance in which an agency is required to or has decided to withhold all or part of a requested record, the agency shall notify the requester of the specific legal authority exempting the requested record or records from disclosure by Code section, subsection, and paragraph within a reasonable amount of time not to exceed three business days or in the event the search and retrieval of records is delayed pursuant to this subsection or pursuant to subparagraph (b)(1)(A) of this Code section, then no later than three business days after the records have been retrieved. In any instance in which an agency will seek costs in excess of \$25.00 for responding to a request, the agency shall notify the requester within a reasonable amount of time not to exceed three business days and inform the requester of the estimate of the costs, and the agency may defer search and retrieval of the records until the requester agrees to pay the estimated costs unless the requester has stated in his or her request a willingness to pay an amount that exceeds the search and retrieval costs. In any instance in which the estimated costs for production of the records exceeds \$500.00, an agency may insist on prepayment of the costs prior to beginning search, retrieval, review, or production of the records. Whenever any person who has requested to inspect or copy a public record has not paid the cost for search, retrieval, redaction, or copying of such records when such charges have been lawfully incurred, an agency may require prepayment for compliance with all future requests for production of records from that person until the costs for the prior production of records have been paid or the dispute regarding payment resolved.
- (e) Requests by civil litigants for records that are sought as part of or for use in any ongoing civil or administrative litigation against an agency shall be made in writing and copied to counsel of record for that agency contemporaneously with their submission to that agency. The agency shall provide, at no cost, duplicate sets of all records produced in response to the request to counsel of

record for that agency unless the counsel of record for that agency elects not to receive the records.

- (f) As provided in this subsection, an agency's use of electronic record-keeping systems must not erode the public's right of access to records under this article. Agencies shall produce electronic copies of or, if the requester prefers, printouts of electronic records or data from data base fields that the agency maintains using the computer programs that the agency has in its possession. An agency shall not refuse to produce such electronic records, data, or data fields on the grounds that exporting data or redaction of exempted information will require inputting range, search, filter, report parameters, or similar commands or instructions into an agency's computer system so long as such commands or instructions can be executed using existing computer programs that the agency uses in the ordinary course of business to access, support, or otherwise manage the records or data. A requester may request that electronic records, data, or data fields be produced in the format in which such data or electronic records are kept by the agency, or in a standard export format such as a flat file electronic American Standard Code for Information Interchange (ASCII) format, if the agency's existing computer programs support such an export format. In such instance, the data or electronic records shall be downloaded in such format onto suitable electronic media by the agency.
- (g) Requests to inspect or copy electronic messages, whether in the form of e-mail, text message, or other format, should contain information about the messages that is reasonably calculated to allow the recipient of the request to locate the messages sought, including, if known, the name, title, or office of the specific person or persons whose electronic messages are sought and, to the extent possible, the specific data bases to be searched for such messages.
- (h) In lieu of providing separate printouts or copies of records or data, an agency may provide access to records through a website accessible by the public. However, if an agency receives a request for data fields, an agency shall not refuse to provide the responsive data on the grounds that the data is available in whole or in its constituent parts through a website if the requester seeks the data in the electronic format in which it is kept. Additionally, if an agency contracts with a private vendor to collect or maintain public records, the agency shall ensure that the arrangement does not limit public access to those records and that the vendor does not impede public record access and method of delivery as established by the agency or as otherwise provided for in this Code section.
- (i) Any computerized index of county real estate deed records shall be printed for purposes of public inspection no less than every 30 days, and any correction made on such index shall be made a part of the printout and shall reflect the time and date that such index was corrected.
- (j) No public officer or agency shall be required to prepare new reports, summaries, or compilations not in existence at the time of the request.

# VII. <u>Illinois</u> – 5 ILL. COMP. STAT. 140/6(a)

#### 140/6. Authority to charge fees

- (a) When a person requests a copy of a record maintained in an electronic format, the public body shall furnish it in the electronic format specified by the requester, if feasible. If it is not feasible to furnish the public records in the specified electronic format, then the public body shall furnish it in the format in which it is maintained by the public body, or in paper format at the option of the requester. A public body may charge the requester for the actual cost of purchasing the recording medium, whether disc, diskette, tape, or other medium. If a request is not a request for a commercial purpose or a voluminous request, a public body may not charge the requester for the costs of any search for and review of the records or other personnel costs associated with reproducing the records. Except to the extent that the General Assembly expressly provides, statutory fees applicable to copies of public records when furnished in a paper format shall not be applicable to those records when furnished in an electronic format.
- (a-5) If a voluminous request is for electronic records and those records are not in a portable document format (PDF), the public body may charge up to \$20 for not more than 2 megabytes of data, up to \$40 for more than 2 but not more than 4 megabytes of data, and up to \$100 for more than 4 megabytes of data. If a voluminous request is for electronic records and those records are in a portable document format, the public body may charge up to \$20 for not more than 80 megabytes of data, up to \$40 for more than 80 megabytes but not more than 160 megabytes of data, and up to \$100 for more than 160 megabytes of data. If the responsive electronic records are in both a portable document format and not in a portable document format, the public body may separate the fees and charge the requester under both fee scales.

If a public body imposes a fee pursuant to this subsection (a-5), it must provide the requester with an accounting of all fees, costs, and personnel hours in connection with the request for public records.

- (b) Except when a fee is otherwise fixed by statute, each public body may charge fees reasonably calculated to reimburse its actual cost for reproducing and certifying public records and for the use, by any person, of the equipment of the public body to copy records. No fees shall be charged for the first 50 pages of black and white, letter or legal sized copies requested by a requester. The fee for black and white, letter or legal sized copies shall not exceed 15 cents per page. If a public body provides copies in color or in a size other than letter or legal, the public body may not charge more than its actual cost for reproducing the records. In calculating its actual cost for reproducing records or for the use of the equipment of the public body to reproduce records, a public body shall not include the costs of any search for and review of the records or other personnel costs associated with reproducing the records, except for commercial requests as provided in subsection (f) of this Section. Such fees shall be imposed according to a standard scale of fees, established and made public by the body imposing them. The cost for certifying a record shall not exceed \$1.
- (c) Documents shall be furnished without charge or at a reduced charge, as determined by the public body, if the person requesting the documents states the specific purpose for the request and indicates that a waiver or reduction of the fee is in the public interest. Waiver or reduction of the fee is in the public interest if the principal purpose of the request is to access and disseminate information regarding the health, safety and welfare or the legal rights of the general public and

is not for the principal purpose of personal or commercial benefit. For purposes of this subsection, "commercial benefit" shall not apply to requests made by news media when the principal purpose of the request is to access and disseminate information regarding the health, safety, and welfare or the legal rights of the general public. In setting the amount of the waiver or reduction, the public body may take into consideration the amount of materials requested and the cost of copying them.

- (d) The imposition of a fee not consistent with subsections (6)(a) and (b) of this Act constitutes a denial of access to public records for the purposes of judicial review.  $\underline{1}$
- (e) The fee for each abstract of a driver's record shall be as provided in Section 6-118 of "The Illinois Vehicle Code", approved September 29, 1969, as amended, whether furnished as a paper copy or as an electronic copy.
- (f) A public body may charge up to \$10 for each hour spent by personnel in searching for and retrieving a requested record or examining the record for necessary redactions. No fees shall be charged for the first 8 hours spent by personnel in searching for or retrieving a requested record. A public body may charge the actual cost of retrieving and transporting public records from an off-site storage facility when the public records are maintained by a third-party storage company under contract with the public body. If a public body imposes a fee pursuant to this subsection (f), it must provide the requester with an accounting of all fees, costs, and personnel hours in connection with the request for public records. The provisions of this subsection (f) apply only to commercial requests.

# VIII. <u>Iowa</u> – Iowa Code § 22.3A

# 22.3A. Access to data processing software

<[Text subject to final changes by the Iowa Code Editor for Code 2016.]>

#### 1. As used in this section:

- a. "Access" means the instruction of, communication with, storage of data in, or retrieval of data from a computer.
- b. "Computer" means an electronic device which performs logical, arithmetical, and memory functions by manipulations of electronic or magnetic impulses, and includes all input, output, processing, storage, and communication facilities which are connected or related to the computer including a computer network. As used in this paragraph, "computer" includes any central processing unit, front-end processing unit, miniprocessor, or microprocessor, and related peripheral equipment such as data storage devices, document scanners, data entry terminal controllers, and data terminal equipment and systems for computer networks.
- c. "Computer network" means a set of related, remotely connected devices and communication facilities including two or more computers with capability to transmit data among them through communication facilities.
- d. "Data" means a representation of information, knowledge, facts, concepts, or instructions that has been prepared or is being prepared in a formalized manner and has been processed, or is intended to be processed, in a computer. Data may be stored in any form, including but not limited to a printout, magnetic storage media, disk, compact disc, punched card, or as memory of a computer.
- e. "Data processing software" means an ordered set of instructions or statements that, when executed by a computer, causes the computer to process data, and includes any program or set of programs, procedures, or routines used to employ and control capabilities of computer hardware. As used in this paragraph "data processing software" includes but is not limited to an operating system, compiler, assembler, utility, library resource, maintenance routine, application, computer networking program, or the associated documentation.
- 2. a. A government body may provide, restrict, or prohibit access to data processing software developed by the government body or developed by a nongovernment body and used by a government body pursuant to a contractual relationship with the nongovernment body, regardless of whether the data processing software is separated or combined with a public record. A government body shall establish policies and procedures to provide access to public records which are combined with its data processing software. A public record shall not be withheld from the public because it is combined with data processing software.
  - b. A government body shall not acquire any electronic data processing system for the storage, manipulation, or retrieval of public records that would impair the government body's ability to permit the examination of a public record and the copying of a public record in either written or electronic form.
  - c. If a public record is only available as a part of or in combination with data processing software in order to permit the examination or copying of the public record, the government body shall bear the cost of separation of the public record from the data processing software.

- d. An electronic public record shall be made available in the format in which it is readily accessible to the government body if that format is useable with commonly available data processing or database management software. The government body may make a public record available in a specific format requested by a person that is different from that in which the public record is readily accessible to the government body and may charge the reasonable costs of any required processing, programming, or other work required to produce the public record in the specific format in addition to any other costs allowed under this chapter.
- e. The cost chargeable to a person receiving a public record separated from data processing software under this subsection shall not be in excess of the charge under this chapter unless the person receiving the public record requests that the public record be specially processed or produced in a format different from that in which the public record is readily accessible to the government body.
- f. A government body may establish payment rates and procedures required to provide access to data processing software, regardless of whether the data processing software is separated from or combined with a public record. Proceeds from payments may be considered repayment receipts, as defined in section 8.2. The payment amount shall be calculated as follows:
  - (1) The amount charged for access to a public record shall be not more than that required to recover direct publication costs, including but not limited to editing, compilation, and media production costs, incurred by the government body in developing the data processing software and preparing the data processing software for transfer to the person. The amount shall be in addition to any other fee required to be paid under this chapter for the examination and copying of a public record. If a person accesses a public record stored in an electronic format that does not require formatting, editing, or compiling to access the public record, the charge for providing the accessed public record shall not exceed the reasonable cost of accessing that public record. The government body shall, if requested, provide documentation which explains and justifies the amount charged. This subparagraph shall not apply to any publication for which a price has been established pursuant to another section, including section 2A.5.
  - (2) If access to the data processing software is provided to a person for a purpose other than provided in subparagraph (1), the amount may be established according to the discretion of the government body, and may be based upon competitive market considerations as determined by the government body.
- 3. A government body is granted and may apply for and receive any legal protection necessary to secure a right to or an interest in data processing software developed by the government body, including but not limited to federal copyright, patent, and trademark protections, and any trade secret protection available under chapter 550. The government body may enter into agreements for the sale or distribution of its data processing software, including marketing and licensing agreements. The government body may impose conditions upon the use of the data processing software that is otherwise consistent with state and federal law.

# IX. Kentucky - Ky. Rev. Stat. Ann. § 61.874

# 61.874 Abstracts, memoranda, copies; agency may prescribe fee; use of nonexempt public records for commercial purposes; online access

- (1) Upon inspection, the applicant shall have the right to make abstracts of the public records and memoranda thereof, and to obtain copies of all public records not exempted by the terms of KRS 61.878. When copies are requested, the custodian may require a written request and advance payment of the prescribed fee, including postage where appropriate. If the applicant desires copies of public records other than written records, the custodian of the records shall duplicate the records or permit the applicant to duplicate the records; however, the custodian shall ensure that such duplication will not damage or alter the original records.
- (2) (a) Nonexempt public records used for noncommercial purposes shall be available for copying in either standard electronic or standard hard copy format, as designated by the party requesting the records, where the agency currently maintains the records in electronic format. Nonexempt public records used for noncommercial purposes shall be copied in standard hard copy format where agencies currently maintain records in hard copy format. Agencies are not required to convert hard copy format records to electronic formats.
  - (b) The minimum standard format in paper form shall be defined as not less than 8 1/2 inches x 11 inches in at least one (1) color on white paper, or for electronic format, in a flat file electronic American Standard Code for Information Interchange (ASCII) format. If the public agency maintains electronic public records in a format other than ASCII, and this format conforms to the requestor's requirements, the public record may be provided in this alternate electronic format for standard fees as specified by the public agency. Any request for a public record in a form other than the forms described in this section shall be considered a nonstandardized request.
- (3) The public agency may prescribe a reasonable fee for making copies of nonexempt public records requested for use for noncommercial purposes which shall not exceed the actual cost of reproduction, including the costs of the media and any mechanical processing cost incurred by the public agency, but not including the cost of staff required. If a public agency is asked to produce a record in a nonstandardized format, or to tailor the format to meet the request of an individual or a group, the public agency may at its discretion provide the requested format and recover staff costs as well as any actual costs incurred.
- (4) (a) Unless an enactment of the General Assembly prohibits the disclosure of public records to persons who intend to use them for commercial purposes, if copies of nonexempt public records are requested for commercial purposes, the public agency may establish a reasonable fee.
  - (b) The public agency from which copies of nonexempt public records are requested for a commercial purpose may require a certified statement from the requestor stating the commercial purpose for which they shall be used, and may require the requestor to enter into a contract with the agency. The contract shall permit use of the public records for the stated commercial purpose for a specified fee.
  - (c) The fee provided for in subsection (a) of this section may be based on one or both of the following:

- 1. Cost to the public agency of media, mechanical processing, and staff required to produce a copy of the public record or records;
- 2. Cost to the public agency of the creation, purchase, or other acquisition of the public records.
- (5) It shall be unlawful for a person to obtain a copy of any part of a public record for a:
  - (a) Commercial purpose, without stating the commercial purpose, if a certified statement from the requestor was required by the public agency pursuant to subsection (4)(b) of this section; or
  - (b) Commercial purpose, if the person uses or knowingly allows the use of the public record for a different commercial purpose; or
  - (c) Noncommercial purpose, if the person uses or knowingly allows the use of the public record for a commercial purpose. A newspaper, periodical, radio or television station shall not be held to have used or knowingly allowed the use of the public record for a commercial purpose merely because of its publication or broadcast, unless it has also given its express permission for that commercial use.
- (6) Online access to public records in electronic form, as provided under this section, may be provided and made available at the discretion of the public agency. If a party wishes to access public records by electronic means and the public agency agrees to provide online access, a public agency may require that the party enter into a contract, license, or other agreement with the agency, and may charge fees for these agreements. Fees shall not exceed:
  - (a) The cost of physical connection to the system and reasonable cost of computer time access charges; and
  - (b) If the records are requested for a commercial purpose, a reasonable fee based on the factors set forth in subsection (4) of this section.

# X. Maryland – MD. Code Ann., General Provisions § 4-205

# § 4-205. Copies; printouts; photographs; electronic format

#### "Metadata" defined

- (a)(1) In this section, "metadata" means information, generally not visible when an electronic document is printed, describing the history, tracking, or management of the electronic document, including information about data in the electronic document that describes how, when, and by whom the data is collected, created, accessed, or modified and how the data is formatted.
  - (2) "Metadata" does not include:
    - (i) a spreadsheet formula;
    - (ii) a database field;
    - (iii) an externally or internally linked file; or
    - (iv) a reference to an external file or a hyperlink.

#### In general

- (b) Except as otherwise provided in this section, if an applicant who is authorized to inspect a public record requests a copy, printout, or photograph of the public record, the custodian shall provide the applicant with:
  - (1) a copy, printout, or photograph of the public record; or
  - (2) if the custodian does not have facilities to reproduce the public record, access to the public record to make the copy, printout, or photograph.

#### Public record in electronic format

- (c)(1) Except as provided in paragraph (2) of this subsection, the custodian of a public record shall provide an applicant with a copy of the public record in a searchable and analyzable electronic format if:
  - (i) the public record is in a searchable and analyzable electronic format;
  - (ii) the applicant requests a copy of the public record in a searchable and analyzable electronic format; and
  - (iii) the custodian is able to provide a copy of the public record, in whole or in part, in a searchable and analyzable electronic format that does not disclose:
    - 1. confidential or protected information for which the custodian is required to deny inspection in accordance with Subtitle 3, Parts I through III of this title; or
    - 2. information for which a custodian has chosen to deny inspection in accordance with Subtitle 3, Part IV of this title.
  - (2) The State Department of Assessments and Taxation is not required to provide an applicant with a copy of the public record in a searchable and analyzable electronic format if the State Department of Assessments and Taxation has provided the public record to a contractor that will provide the applicant a copy of the public record in a searchable and analyzable electronic format for a reasonable cost.

- (3) A custodian may remove metadata from an electronic document before providing the electronic document to an applicant by:
  - (i) using a software program or function; or
  - (ii) converting the electronic document into a different searchable and analyzable format.
- (4) This subsection may not be construed to:
  - (i) require the custodian to reconstruct a public record in an electronic format if the custodian no longer has the public record available in an electronic format;
  - (ii) allow a custodian to make a public record available only in an electronic format;
  - (iii) require a custodian to create, compile, or program a new public record; or
  - (iv) require a custodian to release an electronic record in a format that would jeopardize or compromise the security or integrity of the original record or of any proprietary software in which the record is maintained.
- (5) If a public record exists in a searchable and analyzable electronic format, the act of a custodian providing a portion of the public record in a searchable and analyzable electronic format does not constitute creating a new public record.

# Conditions for making a copy, printout, or photograph; schedule

- (d)(1) The copy, printout, or photograph shall be made:
  - (i) while the public record is in the custody of the custodian; and
  - (ii) whenever practicable, where the public record is kept.
  - (2) The official custodian may set a reasonable time schedule to make copies, printouts, or photographs.

# XI. Minnesota - MINN. STAT. § 13.03

#### 13.03. Access to government data

Subdivision 1. Public data. All government data collected, created, received, maintained or disseminated by a government entity shall be public unless classified by statute, or temporary classification pursuant to section 13.06, or federal law, as nonpublic or protected nonpublic, or with respect to data on individuals, as private or confidential. The responsible authority in every government entity shall keep records containing government data in such an arrangement and condition as to make them easily accessible for convenient use. Photographic, photostatic, microphotographic, or microfilmed records shall be considered as accessible for convenient use regardless of the size of such records.

- Subd. 2. Procedures. (a) The responsible authority in every government entity shall establish procedures, consistent with this chapter, to insure that requests for government data are received and complied with in an appropriate and prompt manner.
- (b) Full convenience and comprehensive accessibility shall be allowed to researchers including historians, genealogists and other scholars to carry out extensive research and complete copying of all records containing government data except as otherwise expressly provided by law.

A responsible authority may designate one or more designees.

- **Subd. 3. Request for access to data.** (a) Upon request to a responsible authority or designee, a person shall be permitted to inspect and copy public government data at reasonable times and places, and, upon request, shall be informed of the data's meaning. If a person requests access for the purpose of inspection, the responsible authority may not assess a charge or require the requesting person to pay a fee to inspect data.
- (b) For purposes of this section, "inspection" includes, but is not limited to, the visual inspection of paper and similar types of government data. Inspection does not include printing copies by the government entity, unless printing a copy is the only method to provide for inspection of the data. In the case of data stored in electronic form and made available in electronic form on a remote access basis to the public by the government entity, inspection includes remote access to the data by the public and the ability to print copies of or download the data on the public's own computer equipment. Nothing in this section prohibits a government entity from charging a reasonable fee for remote access to data under a specific statutory grant of authority. A government entity may charge a fee for remote access to data where either the data or the access is enhanced at the request of the person seeking access.
- (c) The responsible authority or designee shall provide copies of public data upon request. If a person requests copies or electronic transmittal of the data to the person, the responsible authority may require the requesting person to pay the actual costs of searching for and retrieving government data, including the cost of employee time, and for making, certifying, and electronically transmitting the copies of the data or the data, but may not charge for separating public from not public data. However, if 100 or fewer pages of black and white, letter or legal size paper copies are requested, actual costs shall not be used, and instead, the responsible authority may charge no more than 25 cents for each page copied. If the responsible authority or designee is not able to provide copies at the time a request is made, copies shall be supplied as soon as reasonably possible.

- (d) When a request under this subdivision involves any person's receipt of copies of public government data that has commercial value and is a substantial and discrete portion of or an entire formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, process, database, or system developed with a significant expenditure of public funds by the government entity, the responsible authority may charge a reasonable fee for the information in addition to the costs of making and certifying the copies. Any fee charged must be clearly demonstrated by the government entity to relate to the actual development costs of the information. The responsible authority, upon the request of any person, shall provide sufficient documentation to explain and justify the fee being charged.
- (e) The responsible authority of a government entity that maintains public government data in a computer storage medium shall provide to any person making a request under this section a copy of any public data contained in that medium, in electronic form, if the government entity can reasonably make the copy or have a copy made. This does not require a government entity to provide the data in an electronic format or program that is different from the format or program in which the data are maintained by the government entity. The entity may require the requesting person to pay the actual cost of providing the copy.
- (f) If the responsible authority or designee determines that the requested data is classified so as to deny the requesting person access, the responsible authority or designee shall inform the requesting person of the determination either orally at the time of the request, or in writing as soon after that time as possible, and shall cite the specific statutory section, temporary classification, or specific provision of federal law on which the determination is based. Upon the request of any person denied access to data, the responsible authority or designee shall certify in writing that the request has been denied and cite the specific statutory section, temporary classification, or specific provision of federal law upon which the denial was based.
- Subd. 4. Change in classification of data; effect of dissemination among agencies. (a) The classification of a government entity's data shall change if it is required to do so to comply with either judicial or administrative rules pertaining to the conduct of legal actions or with a specific statute applicable to the data in the possession of the disseminating or receiving entity.
- (b) If data on individuals are classified as both private and confidential by this chapter, or any other statute or federal law, the data are private.
- (c) To the extent that government data are disseminated to a government entity by another government entity, the data disseminated shall have the same classification at the entity receiving them as they had at the entity providing them.
- (d) If a government entity disseminates data to another government entity, a classification provided for by law at the entity receiving the data does not affect the classification of the data at the entity that disseminates the data.
- (e) To the extent that judicial branch data are disseminated to government entities by the judicial branch, the data disseminated shall have the same level of accessibility at the government entity receiving them as they had at the judicial branch entity providing them. If the data have a specific classification in state statute or federal law, the government entity must maintain the data according to the specific classification.
- Subd. 5. Copyright or patent of government data. A government entity may enforce a copyright or acquire a patent for a computer software program or components of a program created by that government entity without statutory authority. In the event that a government

entity acquires a patent to a computer software program or component of a program, the data shall be treated as trade secret information pursuant to section 13.37.

**Subd. 6. Discoverability of not public data.** If a government entity opposes discovery of government data or release of data pursuant to court order on the grounds that the data are classified as not public, the party that seeks access to the data may bring before the appropriate presiding judicial officer, arbitrator, or administrative law judge an action to compel discovery or an action in the nature of an action to compel discovery.

The presiding officer shall first decide whether the data are discoverable or releasable pursuant to the rules of evidence and of criminal, civil, or administrative procedure appropriate to the action.

If the data are discoverable the presiding officer shall decide whether the benefit to the party seeking access to the data outweighs any harm to the confidentiality interests of the entity maintaining the data, or of any person who has provided the data or who is the subject of the data, or to the privacy interest of an individual identified in the data. In making the decision, the presiding officer shall consider whether notice to the subject of the data is warranted and, if warranted, what type of notice must be given. The presiding officer may fashion and issue any protective orders necessary to assure proper handling of the data by the parties. If the data are a videotape of a child victim or alleged victim alleging, explaining, denying, or describing an act of physical or sexual abuse, the presiding officer shall consider the provisions of section 611A.90, subdivision 2, paragraph (b). If the data are data subject to the protections under chapter 5B or section 13.045, the presiding officer shall consider the provisions of section 5B.11.

- **Subd. 7. Data transferred to archives.** When government data that is classified as not public by this chapter or any other statute, including private data on decedents and confidential data on decedents, is physically transferred to the state archives, the data shall no longer be classified as not public and access to and use of the data shall be governed by section 138.17.
- Subd. 8. Change to classification of data not on individuals. Except for security information, nonpublic and protected nonpublic data shall become public either ten years after the creation of the data by the government entity or ten years after the data was received or collected by any governmental entity unless the responsible authority for the originating or custodial entity for the data reasonably determines that, if the data were made available to the public or to the data subject, the harm to the public or to a data subject would outweigh the benefit to the public or to the data subject. If the responsible authority denies access to the data, the person denied access may challenge the denial by bringing an action in district court seeking release of the data. The action shall be brought in the district court located in the county where the data are being maintained, or, in the case of data maintained by a state agency, in any county. The data in dispute shall be examined by the court in camera. In deciding whether or not to release the data, the court shall consider the benefits and harms in the same manner as set forth above. The court shall make a written statement of findings in support of its decision.
- Subd. 9. Effect of changes in classification of data. Unless otherwise expressly provided by a particular statute, the classification of data is determined by the law applicable to the data at the time a request for access to the data is made, regardless of the data's classification at the time it was collected, created, or received.
- Subd. 10. Costs for providing copies of data. Money may be collected by a responsible authority in a state agency for the actual cost to the agency of providing copies or electronic transmittal of government data. When money collected for purposes of this section is of a

magnitude sufficient to warrant a separate account in the state treasury, that money must be deposited in a fund other than the general fund and is appropriated to the agency.

Subd. 11. Treatment of data classified as not public; public meetings. Not public data may be discussed at a meeting open to the public to the extent provided in section 13D.05.

**Subd. 12. Pleadings.** Pleadings, as defined by court rule, served by or on a government entity, are public data to the same extent that the data would be public if filed with the court.

#### XII. Mississippi – Miss. Code Ann. § 25-61-10

#### § 25-61-10. Use of sensitive software

- (1) Any public body that uses sensitive software, as defined in Section 25-61-9, or proprietary software must not thereby diminish the right of the public to inspect and copy a public record. A public body that uses sensitive software, as defined in Section 25-61-9, or proprietary software to store, manipulate, or retrieve a public record will not be deemed to have diminished the right of the public if it either: (a) if legally obtainable, makes a copy of the software available to the public for application to the public records stored, manipulated, or retrieved by the software; or (b) ensures that the software has the capacity to create an electronic copy of each public record stored, manipulated, or retrieved by the software in some common format such as, but not limited to, the American Standard Code for Information Interchange.
- (2) A public body shall provide a copy of the record in the format requested if the public body maintains the record in that format, and the public body may charge a fee which must be in accordance with Section 25-61-7.
- (3) Before a public body acquires or makes a major modification to any information technology system, equipment, or software used to store, retrieve, or manipulate a public record, the public body shall adequately plan for the provision of public access and redaction of exempt or confidential information by the proposed system, equipment or software.
- (4) A public body may not enter into a contract for the creation or maintenance of a public records data base if that contract impairs the ability of the public to inspect or copy the public records of that agency, including public records that are on-line or stored in an information technology system used by the public body.

#### XIII. Missouri - Mo. Rev. Stat. § 610.023

# 610.023. Records of governmental bodies to be in care of custodian, duties--records may be copied but not removed, exception, procedure--denial of access, procedure

- 1. Each public governmental body is to appoint a custodian who is to be responsible for the maintenance of that body's records. The identity and location of a public governmental body's custodian is to be made available upon request.
- 2. Each public governmental body shall make available for inspection and copying by the public of that body's public records. No person shall remove original public records from the office of a public governmental body or its custodian without written permission of the designated custodian. No public governmental body shall, after August 28, 1998, grant to any person or entity, whether by contract, license or otherwise, the exclusive right to access and disseminate any public record unless the granting of such right is necessary to facilitate coordination with, or uniformity among, industry regulators having similar authority.
- 3. Each request for access to a public record shall be acted upon as soon as possible, but in no event later than the end of the third business day following the date the request is received by the custodian of records of a public governmental body. If records are requested in a certain format, the public body shall provide the records in the requested format, if such format is available. If access to the public record is not granted immediately, the custodian shall give a detailed explanation of the cause for further delay and the place and earliest time and date that the record will be available for inspection. This period for document production may exceed three days for reasonable cause.
- 4. If a request for access is denied, the custodian shall provide, upon request, a written statement of the grounds for such denial. Such statement shall cite the specific provision of law under which access is denied and shall be furnished to the requester no later than the end of the third business day following the date that the request for the statement is received.

# XIV. Nebraska – Neb. Rev. Stat. § 84-712

# 84-712. Public records; free examination; memorandum and abstracts; copies; fees

- (1) Except as otherwise expressly provided by statute, all citizens of this state and all other persons interested in the examination of the public records as defined in section 84-712.01 are hereby fully empowered and authorized to (a) examine such records, and make memoranda, copies using their own copying or photocopying equipment in accordance with subsection (2) of this section, and abstracts therefrom, all free of charge, during the hours the respective offices may be kept open for the ordinary transaction of business and (b) except if federal copyright law otherwise provides, obtain copies of public records in accordance with subsection (3) of this section during the hours the respective offices may be kept open for the ordinary transaction of business.
- (2) Copies made by citizens or other persons using their own copying or photocopying equipment pursuant to subdivision (1)(a) of this section shall be made on the premises of the custodian of the public record or at a location mutually agreed to by the requester and the custodian.
- (3)(a) Copies may be obtained pursuant to subdivision (1)(b) of this section only if the custodian has copying equipment reasonably available. Such copies may be obtained in any form designated by the requester in which the public record is maintained or produced, including, but not limited to, printouts, electronic data, discs, tapes, and photocopies. This section shall not be construed to require a custodian to copy any public record that is available to the requester on the custodian's web site on the Internet. The custodian of the public record is required to provide the location of the public record on the Internet to the requester. If the requester does not have reasonable access to the Internet due to lack of computer, lack of Internet availability, or inability to use a computer or the Internet, the custodian shall produce copies for the requester.
  - (b) Except as otherwise provided by statute, the public body, public entity, or public official which is the custodian of a public record may charge a fee for providing copies of such public record pursuant to subdivision (1)(b) of this section, which fee shall not exceed the actual added cost of making the copies available. For purposes of this subdivision, (i) for photocopies, the actual added cost of making the copies available shall not exceed the amount of the reasonably calculated actual added cost of the photocopies, which may include a reasonably apportioned cost of the supplies, such as paper, toner, and equipment, used in preparing the copies, as well as any additional payment obligation of the custodian for time of contractors necessarily incurred to comply with the request for copies, (ii) for printouts of computerized data on paper, the actual added cost of making the copies available shall include the reasonably calculated actual added cost of computer run time and the cost of materials for making the copy, and (iii) for electronic data, the actual added cost of making the copies available shall include the reasonably calculated actual added cost of the computer run time, any necessary analysis and programming by the public body, public entity, public official, or third-party information technology services company contracted to provide computer services to the public body, public entity, or public official, and the production of the report in the form furnished to the requester.
  - (c) The actual added cost used as the basis for the calculation of a fee for records shall not include any charge for the existing salary or pay obligation to the public officers or

employees with respect to the first four cumulative hours of searching, identifying, physically redacting, or copying. A special service charge reflecting the calculated labor cost may be included in the fee for time required in excess of four cumulative hours, since that large a request may cause some delay or disruption of the other responsibilities of the custodian's office, except that the fee for records shall not include any charge for the services of an attorney to review the requested public records seeking a legal basis to withhold the public records from the public.

- (d) State agencies which provide electronic access to public records through a portal established under section 84-1204 shall obtain approval of their proposed reasonable fees for such records pursuant to sections 84-1205. 02 and 84-1205.03, if applicable, and the actual added cost of making the copies available may include the approved fee for the portal.
- (e) This section shall not be construed to require a public body or custodian of a public record to produce or generate any public record in a new or different form or format modified from that of the original public record.
- (f) If copies requested in accordance with subdivision (1)(b) of this section are estimated by the custodian of such public records to cost more than fifty dollars, the custodian may require the requester to furnish a deposit prior to fulfilling such request.
- (4) Upon receipt of a written request for access to or copies of a public record, the custodian of such record shall provide to the requester as soon as is practicable and without delay, but not more than four business days after actual receipt of the request, an estimate of the expected cost of the copies and either (a) access to or, if copying equipment is reasonably available, copies of the public record, (b) if there is a legal basis for denial of access or copies, a written denial of the request together with the information specified in section 84-712.04, or (c) if the entire request cannot with reasonable good faith efforts be fulfilled within four business days after actual receipt of the request due to the significant difficulty or the extensiveness of the request, a written explanation, including the earliest practicable date for fulfilling the request, an estimate of the expected cost of any copies, and an opportunity for the requester to modify or prioritize the items within the request. The requester shall have ten business days to review the estimated costs, including any special service charge, and request the custodian to fulfill the original request, negotiate with the custodian to narrow or simplify the request, or withdraw the request. If the requester does not respond to the custodian within ten business days, the custodian shall not proceed to fulfill the request. The four business days shall be computed by excluding the day the request is received, after which the designated period of time begins to run. Business day does not include a Saturday, a Sunday, or a day during which the offices of the custodian of the public records are closed.

#### XV. New Jersey - N.J. STAT. ANN. § 47:1A-5

# 47:1A-5. Custodian of government records to permit inspection, examination and copying; certain information to be redacted; purchase of records; immediate access in certain circumstances

- a. The custodian of a government record shall permit the record to be inspected, examined, and copied by any person during regular business hours; or in the case of a municipality having a population of 5,000 or fewer according to the most recent federal decennial census, a board of education having a total district enrollment of 500 or fewer, or a public authority having less than \$10 million in assets, during not less than six regular business hours over not less than three business days per week or the entity's regularly-scheduled business hours, whichever is less: unless a government record is exempt from public access by: P.L.1963, c. 73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) as amended and supplemented; any other statute; resolution of either or both houses of the Legislature; regulation promulgated under the authority of any statute or Executive Order of the Governor; Executive Order of the Governor; Rules of Court; any federal law; federal regulation; or federal order. Prior to allowing access to any government record, the custodian thereof shall redact from that record any information which discloses the social security number, credit card number, unlisted telephone number, or driver license number of any person; except for use by any government agency, including any court or law enforcement agency, in carrying out its functions, or any private person or entity acting on behalf thereof, or any private person or entity seeking to enforce payment of court-ordered child support; except with respect to the disclosure of driver information by the New Jersey Motor Vehicle Commission as permitted by section 2 of P.L.1997, c. 188 (C.39:2-3.4); and except that a social security number contained in a record required by law to be made, maintained or kept on file by a public agency shall be disclosed when access to the document or disclosure of that information is not otherwise prohibited by State or federal law, regulation or order or by State statute, resolution of either or both houses of the Legislature, Executive Order of the Governor, rule of court or regulation promulgated under the authority of any statute or executive order of the Governor. Except where an agency can demonstrate an emergent need, a regulation that limits access to government records shall not be retroactive in effect or applied to deny a request for access to a government record that is pending before the agency, the council or a court at the time of the adoption of the regulation.
- b. (1) A copy or copies of a government record may be purchased by any person upon payment of the fee prescribed by law or regulation. Except as otherwise provided by law or regulation and except as provided in paragraph (2) of this subsection, the fee assessed for the duplication of a government record embodied in the form of printed matter shall be \$0.05 per letter size page or smaller, and \$0.07 per legal size page or larger. If a public agency can demonstrate that its actual costs for duplication of a government record exceed the foregoing rates, the public agency shall be permitted to charge the actual cost of duplicating the record. The actual cost of duplicating the record, upon which all copy fees are based, shall be the cost of materials and supplies used to make a copy of the record, but shall not include the cost of labor or other overhead expenses associated with making the copy except as provided for in subsection c. of this section. Access to electronic records and non-printed materials shall be provided free of charge, but the public agency may charge for the actual costs of any needed supplies such as computer discs.

- (2) No fee shall be charged to a victim of a crime for a copy or copies of a record to which the crime victim is entitled to access, as provided in section 1 of P.L.1995, c. 23 (C.47:1A-1.1).
- c. Whenever the nature, format, manner of collation, or volume of a government record embodied in the form of printed matter to be inspected, examined, or copied pursuant to this section is such that the record cannot be reproduced by ordinary document copying equipment in ordinary business size or involves an extraordinary expenditure of time and effort to accommodate the request, the public agency may charge, in addition to the actual cost of duplicating the record, a special service charge that shall be reasonable and shall be based upon the actual direct cost of providing the copy or copies; provided, however, that in the case of a municipality, rates for the duplication of particular records when the actual cost of copying exceeds the foregoing rates shall be established in advance by ordinance. The requestor shall have the opportunity to review and object to the charge prior to it being incurred.
- d. A custodian shall permit access to a government record and provide a copy thereof in the medium requested if the public agency maintains the record in that medium. If the public agency does not maintain the record in the medium requested, the custodian shall either convert the record to the medium requested or provide a copy in some other meaningful medium. If a request is for a record: (1) in a medium not routinely used by the agency; (2) not routinely developed or maintained by an agency; or (3) requiring a substantial amount of manipulation or programming of information technology, the agency may charge, in addition to the actual cost of duplication, a special charge that shall be reasonable and shall be based on the cost for any extensive use of information technology, or for the labor cost of personnel providing the service, that is actually incurred by the agency or attributable to the agency for the programming, clerical, and supervisory assistance required, or both.
- e. Immediate access ordinarily shall be granted to budgets, bills, vouchers, contracts, including collective negotiations agreements and individual employment contracts, and public employee salary and overtime information.
- f. The custodian of a public agency shall adopt a form for the use of any person who requests access to a government record held or controlled by the public agency. The form shall provide space for the name, address, and phone number of the requestor and a brief description of the government record sought. The form shall include space for the custodian to indicate which record will be made available, when the record will be available, and the fees to be charged. The form shall also include the following: (1) specific directions and procedures for requesting a record; (2) a statement as to whether prepayment of fees or a deposit is required; (3) the time period within which the public agency is required by P.L.1963, c. 73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) as amended and supplemented, to make the record available; (4) a statement of the requestor's right to challenge a decision by the public agency to deny access and the procedure for filing an appeal; (5) space for the custodian to list reasons if a request is denied in whole or in part; (6) space for the requestor to sign and date the form; (7) space for the custodian to sign and date the form if the request is fulfilled or denied. The custodian may require a deposit against costs for reproducing documents sought through an anonymous request whenever the custodian anticipates that the information thus requested will cost in excess of \$5 to reproduce.
- g. A request for access to a government record shall be in writing and hand-delivered, mailed, transmitted electronically, or otherwise conveyed to the appropriate custodian. A custodian shall promptly comply with a request to inspect, examine, copy, or provide a copy of a government

record. If the custodian is unable to comply with a request for access, the custodian shall indicate the specific basis therefor on the request form and promptly return it to the requestor. The custodian shall sign and date the form and provide the requestor with a copy thereof. If the custodian of a government record asserts that part of a particular record is exempt from public access pursuant to P.L.1963, c. 73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) as amended and supplemented, the custodian shall delete or excise from a copy of the record that portion which the custodian asserts is exempt from access and shall promptly permit access to the remainder of the record. If the government record requested is temporarily unavailable because it is in use or in storage, the custodian shall so advise the requestor and shall make arrangements to promptly make available a copy of the record. If a request for access to a government record would substantially disrupt agency operations, the custodian may deny access to the record after attempting to reach a reasonable solution with the requestor that accommodates the interests of the requestor and the agency.

- h. Any officer or employee of a public agency who receives a request for access to a government record shall forward the request to the custodian of the record or direct the requestor to the custodian of the record.
- i. Unless a shorter time period is otherwise provided by statute, regulation, or executive order, a custodian of a government record shall grant access to a government record or deny a request for access to a government record as soon as possible, but not later than seven business days after receiving the request, provided that the record is currently available and not in storage or archived. In the event a custodian fails to respond within seven business days after receiving a request, the failure to respond shall be deemed a denial of the request, unless the requestor has elected not to provide a name, address or telephone number, or other means of contacting the requestor. If the requestor has elected not to provide a name, address, or telephone number, or other means of contacting the requestor, the custodian shall not be required to respond until the requestor reappears before the custodian seeking a response to the original request. If the government record is in storage or archived, the requestor shall be so advised within seven business days after the custodian receives the request. The requestor shall be advised by the custodian when the record can be made available. If the record is not made available by that time, access shall be deemed denied.
- j. A custodian shall post prominently in public view in the part or parts of the office or offices of the custodian that are open to or frequented by the public a statement that sets forth in clear, concise and specific terms the right to appeal a denial of, or failure to provide, access to a government record by any person for inspection, examination, or copying or for purchase of copies thereof and the procedure by which an appeal may be filed.
- k. The files maintained by the Office of the Public Defender that relate to the handling of any case shall be considered confidential and shall not be open to inspection by any person unless authorized by law, court order, or the State Public Defender.

#### **XVI.** New Mexico - N.M. STAT. ANN. § 14-2-9

#### § 14-2-9. Procedure for inspection

A. Requested public records containing information that is exempt and nonexempt from disclosure shall be separated by the custodian prior to inspection, and the nonexempt information shall be made available for inspection. If necessary to preserve the integrity of computer data or the confidentiality of exempt information contained in a database, a partial printout of data containing public records or information may be furnished in lieu of an entire database. Exempt information in an electronic document shall be removed along with the corresponding metadata prior to disclosure by utilizing methods or redaction tools that prevent the recovery of exempt information from a redacted electronic document.

B. A custodian shall provide a copy of a public record in electronic format if the public record is available in electronic format and an electronic copy is specifically requested. However, a custodian is only required to provide the electronic record in the file format in which it exists at the time of the request.

#### C. A custodian:

- (1) may charge reasonable fees for copying the public records, unless a different fee is otherwise prescribed by law;
- (2) shall not charge fees in excess of one dollar (\$1.00) per printed page for documents eleven inches by seventeen inches in size or smaller;
- (3) may charge the actual costs associated with downloading copies of public records to a computer disk or storage device, including the actual cost of the computer disk or storage device;
- (4) may charge the actual costs associated with transmitting copies of public records by mail, electronic mail or facsimile;
- (5) may require advance payment of the fees before making copies of public records;
- (6) shall not charge a fee for the cost of determining whether any public record is subject to disclosure; and
- (7) shall provide a receipt, upon request.
- D. Nothing in this section regarding the provision of public data in electronic format shall limit the ability of the custodian to engage in the sale of data as authorized by Sections 14-3-15.1 and 14-3-18 NMSA 1978, including imposing reasonable restrictions on the use of the database and the payment of a royalty or other consideration.

#### XVII. North Carolina - N.C. GEN. STAT. § 132-6.2

#### § 132-6.2. Provisions for copies of public records; fees

- (a) Persons requesting copies of public records may elect to obtain them in any and all media in which the public agency is capable of providing them. No request for copies of public records in a particular medium shall be denied on the grounds that the custodian has made or prefers to make the public records available in another medium. The public agency may assess different fees for different media as prescribed by law.
- (b) Persons requesting copies of public records may request that the copies be certified or uncertified. The fees for certifying copies of public records shall be as provided by law. Except as otherwise provided by law, no public agency shall charge a fee for an uncertified copy of a public record that exceeds the actual cost to the public agency of making the copy. For purposes of this subsection, "actual cost" is limited to direct, chargeable costs related to the reproduction of a public record as determined by generally accepted accounting principles and does not include costs that would have been incurred by the public agency if a request to reproduce a public record had not been made. Notwithstanding the provisions of this subsection, if the request is such as to require extensive use of information technology resources or extensive clerical or supervisory assistance by personnel of the agency involved, or if producing the record in the medium requested results in a greater use of information technology resources than that established by the agency for reproduction of the volume of information requested, then the agency may charge, in addition to the actual cost of duplication, a special service charge, which shall be reasonable and shall be based on the actual cost incurred for such extensive use of information technology resources or the labor costs of the personnel providing the services, or for a greater use of information technology resources that is actually incurred by the agency or attributable to the agency. If anyone requesting public information from any public agency is charged a fee that the requester believes to be unfair or unreasonable, the requester may ask the State Chief Information Officer or his designee to mediate the dispute.
- (c) Persons requesting copies of computer databases may be required to make or submit such requests in writing. Custodians of public records shall respond to all such requests as promptly as possible. If the request is granted, the copies shall be provided as soon as reasonably possible. If the request is denied, the denial shall be accompanied by an explanation of the basis for the denial. If asked to do so, the person denying the request shall, as promptly as possible, reduce the explanation for the denial to writing.
- (d) Nothing in this section shall be construed to require a public agency to respond to requests for copies of public records outside of its usual business hours.
- (e) Nothing in this section shall be construed to require a public agency to respond to a request for a copy of a public record by creating or compiling a record that does not exist. If a public agency, as a service to the requester, voluntarily elects to create or compile a record, it may negotiate a reasonable charge for the service with the requester. Nothing in this section shall be construed to require a public agency to put into electronic medium a record that is not kept in electronic medium.

#### XVIII. North Dakota – N.D. CENT. CODE § 44-04-18

#### § 44-04-18. Access to public records—Electronically stored information

- 1. Except as otherwise specifically provided by law, all records of a public entity are public records, open and accessible for inspection during reasonable office hours. As used in this subsection, "reasonable office hours" includes all regular office hours of a public entity. If a public entity does not have regular office hours, the name and telephone number of a contact person authorized to provide access to the public entity's records must be posted on the door of the office of the public entity, if any. Otherwise, the information regarding the contact person must be filed with the secretary of state for state-level entities, for public entities defined in subdivision c of subsection 13 of section 44-04-17.1, the city auditor or designee of the city for city-level entities, or the county auditor or designee of the county for other entities.
- 2. Upon request for a copy of specific public records, any entity subject to subsection 1 shall furnish the requester one copy of the public records requested. A request need not be made in person or in writing, and the copy must be mailed upon request. A public entity may charge up to twenty-five cents per impression of a paper copy. As used in this section, "paper copy" means a one-sided or two-sided duplicated copy of a size not more than eight and one-half by fourteen inches [19.05 by 35.56 centimeters]. For any copy of a record that is not a paper copy as defined in this section, the public entity may charge a reasonable fee for making the copy. As used in this section, "reasonable fee" means the actual cost to the public entity of making the copy, including labor, materials, and equipment. The entity may charge for the actual cost of postage to mail a copy of a record. An entity may require payment before locating, redacting, making, or mailing the copy. The public entity may withhold records pursuant to a request until such time as a requester provides payment for any outstanding balance for prior requests. An entity may impose a fee not exceeding twenty-five dollars per hour per request, excluding the initial hour, for locating records, including electronic records, if locating the records requires more than one hour. An entity may impose a fee not exceeding twenty-five dollars per hour per request, excluding the initial hour, for excising confidential or closed material under section 44-04-18.10 from the records, including electronic records. If a public entity receives five or more requests from the same requester within seven days, the public entity may treat the requests as one request in computing the time it takes to locate and excise the records. If the entity is not authorized to use the fees to cover the cost of providing or mailing the copy, or both, or if a copy machine is not readily available, the entity may make arrangements for the copy to be provided or mailed, or both, by another entity, public or private, and the requester shall pay the fee to that other entity. This subsection does not apply to copies of public records for which a different fee is specifically provided by law.
- 3. Automation of public records must not erode the right of access to those records. As each public entity increases its use of and dependence on electronic recordkeeping, each agency must provide reasonable public access to records electronically maintained and must ensure that exempt or confidential records are not disclosed except as otherwise permitted by law. A public entity may not enter into a contract for the creation or maintenance of a public records database if that contract impairs the ability of the public to inspect or copy the public records of the agency, including public records online or stored in an electronic recordkeeping system used by the agency. An electronic copy of a record must be provided upon request at no cost, other than

costs allowed in subsection 2, except if the nature or volume of the public records requested to be accessed or provided requires extensive use of information technology resources, the agency may charge no more than the actual cost incurred for the extensive use of information technology resources incurred by the public entity. "Extensive" is defined as a request for copies of electronic records which take more than one hour of information technology resources to produce.

- 4. Except as provided in this subsection, nothing in this section requires a public entity to create or compile a record that does not exist. Access to an electronically stored record under this section, or a copy thereof, must be provided at the requester's option in either a printed document or through any other available medium. A computer file is not an available medium if no means exist to separate or prevent the disclosure of any closed or confidential information contained in that file. Except as reasonably necessary to reveal the organization of data contained in an electronically stored record, a public entity is not required to provide an electronically stored record in a different structure, format, or organization. This section does not require a public entity to provide a requester with access to a computer terminal.
- 5. A state-level public entity as defined in subdivision a of subsection 13 of section 44-04-17.1 or a political subdivision as defined in subsection 11 of section 44-04-17.1, may establish procedures for providing access from an outside location to any computer database or electronically filed or stored information maintained by that entity. The procedures must address the measures that are necessary to maintain the confidentiality of information protected by federal or state law. Except for access provided to another state-level public entity or political subdivision, the state or political subdivision may charge a reasonable fee for providing that outside access. If the original information is keyed, entered, provided, compiled, or submitted by any political subdivision, the fees must be shared by the state and the political subdivision based on their proportional costs to make the data available.
- 6. Any request under this section for records in the possession of a public entity by a party to a criminal or civil action, adjudicative proceeding as defined in subsection 1 of section 28-32-01, or arbitration in which the public entity is a party, or by an agent of the party, must comply with applicable discovery rules or orders and be made to the attorney representing that entity in the criminal or civil action, adjudicative proceeding, or arbitration. The public entity may deny a request from a party or an agent of a party under this subsection if the request seeks records that are privileged under applicable discovery rules.
- 7. A denial of a request for records made under this section must describe the legal authority for the denial and must be in writing if requested.
- 8. This section is violated when a person's right to review or receive a copy of a record that is not exempt or confidential is denied or unreasonably delayed or when a fee is charged in excess of the amount authorized in subsections 2 and 3.
- 9. It is not an unreasonable delay or a denial of access under this section to withhold from the public a record that is prepared at the express direction of, and for presentation to, a governing body until the record is mailed or otherwise provided to a member of the body or until the next meeting of the body, whichever occurs first. It also is not an unreasonable delay or a denial of access to withhold from the public a working paper or preliminary draft until a final draft is completed, the record is distributed to a member of a governing body or discussed by the body at

an open meeting, or work is discontinued on the draft but no final version has been prepared, whichever occurs first.

- 10. For public entities headed by a single individual, it is not an unreasonable delay or a denial of access to withhold from the public a working paper or preliminary draft until a final draft is completed, or work is discontinued on the draft but no final version has been prepared, whichever occurs first. A working paper or preliminary draft shall be deemed completed if it can reasonably be concluded, upon a good-faith review, that all substantive work on it has been completed.
- 11. A disclosure of a requested record under this section is not a waiver of any copyright held by the public entity in the requested record or of any applicable evidentiary privilege.

#### XIX. Ohio – Ohio Rev. Code Ann. § 149.43

149.43 Availability of public records; mandamus action; training of public employees; public records policy; bulk commercial special extraction requests

#### (A) As used in this section:

- (1) "Public record" means records kept by any public office, including, but not limited to, state, county, city, village, township, and school district units, and records pertaining to the delivery of educational services by an alternative school in this state kept by the nonprofit or for-profit entity operating the alternative school pursuant to section 3313.533 of the Revised Code. "Public record" does not mean any of the following:
  - (a) Medical records;
  - (b) Records pertaining to probation and parole proceedings or to proceedings related to the imposition of community control sanctions and post-release control sanctions;
  - (c) Records pertaining to actions under section 2151.85 and division (C) of section 2919.121 of the Revised Code and to appeals of actions arising under those sections;
  - (d) Records pertaining to adoption proceedings, including the contents of an adoption file maintained by the department of health under sections 3705.12 to 3705.124 of the Revised Code;
  - (e) Information in a record contained in the putative father registry established by section 3107.062 of the Revised Code, regardless of whether the information is held by the department of job and family services or, pursuant to section 3111.69 of the Revised Code, the office of child support in the department or a child support enforcement agency;
  - (f) Records specified in division (A) of section 3107.52 of the Revised Code;
  - (g) Trial preparation records;
  - (h) Confidential law enforcement investigatory records;
  - (i) Records containing information that is confidential under section 2710.03 or 4112.05 of the Revised Code;
  - (j) DNA records stored in the DNA database pursuant to section 109.573 of the Revised Code;
  - (k) Inmate records released by the department of rehabilitation and correction to the department of youth services or a court of record pursuant to division (E) of section 5120.21 of the Revised Code;
  - (I) Records maintained by the department of youth services pertaining to children in its custody released by the department of youth services to the department of rehabilitation and correction pursuant to section 5139.05 of the Revised Code;
  - (m) Intellectual property records;
  - (n) Donor profile records;

- (o) Records maintained by the department of job and family services pursuant to section 3121.894 of the Revised Code;
- (p) Peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation residential and familial information;
- (q) In the case of a county hospital operated pursuant to Chapter 339. of the Revised Code or a municipal hospital operated pursuant to Chapter 749. of the Revised Code, information that constitutes a trade secret, as defined in section 1333.61 of the Revised Code;
- (r) Information pertaining to the recreational activities of a person under the age of eighteen;
- (s) In the case of a child fatality review board acting under sections 307.621 to 307.629 of the Revised Code or a review conducted pursuant to guidelines established by the director of health under section 3701.70 of the Revised Code, records provided to the board or director, statements made by board members during meetings of the board or by persons participating in the director's review, and all work products of the board or director, and in the case of a child fatality review board, child fatality review data submitted by the board to the department of health or a national child death review database, other than the report prepared pursuant to division (A) of section 307.626 of the Revised Code;
- (t) Records provided to and statements made by the executive director of a public children services agency or a prosecuting attorney acting pursuant to section 5153.171 of the Revised Code other than the information released under that section;
- (u) Test materials, examinations, or evaluation tools used in an examination for licensure as a nursing home administrator that the board of executives of long-term services and supports administers under section 4751.04 of the Revised Code or contracts under that section with a private or government entity to administer;
- (v) Records the release of which is prohibited by state or federal law;
- (w) Proprietary information of or relating to any person that is submitted to or compiled by the Ohio venture capital authority created under section 150.01 of the Revised Code;
- (x) Financial statements and data any person submits for any purpose to the Ohio housing finance agency or the controlling board in connection with applying for, receiving, or accounting for financial assistance from the agency, and information that identifies any individual who benefits directly or indirectly from financial assistance from the agency;
- (y) Records listed in section 5101.29 of the Revised Code;
- (z) Discharges recorded with a county recorder under section 317.24 of the Revised Code, as specified in division (B)(2) of that section;
- (aa) Usage information including names and addresses of specific residential and commercial customers of a municipally owned or operated public utility;
- (bb) Records described in division (C) of section 187.04 of the Revised Code that are not designated to be made available to the public as provided in that division;

- (cc) Information and records that are made confidential, privileged, and not subject to disclosure under divisions (B) and (C) of section 2949.221 of the Revised Code.
- (2) "Confidential law enforcement investigatory record" means any record that pertains to a law enforcement matter of a criminal, quasi-criminal, civil, or administrative nature, but only to the extent that the release of the record would create a high probability of disclosure of any of the following:
  - (a) The identity of a suspect who has not been charged with the offense to which the record pertains, or of an information source or witness to whom confidentiality has been reasonably promised;
  - (b) Information provided by an information source or witness to whom confidentiality has been reasonably promised, which information would reasonably tend to disclose the source's or witness's identity;
  - (c) Specific confidential investigatory techniques or procedures or specific investigatory work product;
  - (d) Information that would endanger the life or physical safety of law enforcement personnel, a crime victim, a witness, or a confidential information source.
- (3) "Medical record" means any document or combination of documents, except births, deaths, and the fact of admission to or discharge from a hospital, that pertains to the medical history, diagnosis, prognosis, or medical condition of a patient and that is generated and maintained in the process of medical treatment.
- (4) "Trial preparation record" means any record that contains information that is specifically compiled in reasonable anticipation of, or in defense of, a civil or criminal action or proceeding, including the independent thought processes and personal trial preparation of an attorney.
- (5) "Intellectual property record" means a record, other than a financial or administrative record, that is produced or collected by or for faculty or staff of a state institution of higher learning in the conduct of or as a result of study or research on an educational, commercial, scientific, artistic, technical, or scholarly issue, regardless of whether the study or research was sponsored by the institution alone or in conjunction with a governmental body or private concern, and that has not been publicly released, published, or patented.
- (6) "Donor profile record" means all records about donors or potential donors to a public institution of higher education except the names and reported addresses of the actual donors and the date, amount, and conditions of the actual donation.
- (7) "Peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation residential and familial information" means any information that discloses any of the following about a peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation:

- (a) The address of the actual personal residence of a peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or an investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation, except for the state or political subdivision in which the peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation resides;
- (b) Information compiled from referral to or participation in an employee assistance program;
- (c) The social security number, the residential telephone number, any bank account, debit card, charge card, or credit card number, or the emergency telephone number of, or any medical information pertaining to, a peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation;
- (d) The name of any beneficiary of employment benefits, including, but not limited to, life insurance benefits, provided to a peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation by the peace officer's, parole officer's, probation officer's, bailiff's, prosecuting attorney's, assistant prosecuting attorney's, correctional employee's, community-based correctional facility employee's, youth services employee's, firefighter's, EMT's, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation's employer;
- (e) The identity and amount of any charitable or employment benefit deduction made by the peace officer's, parole officer's, probation officer's, bailiff's, prosecuting attorney's, assistant prosecuting attorney's, correctional employee's, community-based correctional facility employee's, youth services employee's, firefighter's, EMT's, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation's employer from the peace officer's, parole officer's, probation officer's, bailiff's, prosecuting attorney's, assistant prosecuting attorney's, correctional employee's, community-based correctional facility employee's, youth services employee's, firefighter's, EMT's, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation's compensation unless the amount of the deduction is required by state or federal law;
- (f) The name, the residential address, the name of the employer, the address of the employer, the social security number, the residential telephone number, any bank account, debit card, charge card, or credit card number, or the emergency telephone number of the spouse, a former spouse, or any child of a peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation;

(g) A photograph of a peace officer who holds a position or has an assignment that may include undercover or plain clothes positions or assignments as determined by the peace officer's appointing authority.

As used in divisions (A)(7) and (B)(9) of this section, "peace officer" has the same meaning as in section 109.71 of the Revised Code and also includes the superintendent and troopers of the state highway patrol; it does not include the sheriff of a county or a supervisory employee who, in the absence of the sheriff, is authorized to stand in for, exercise the authority of, and perform the duties of the sheriff.

As used in divisions (A)(7) and (B)(9) of this section, "correctional employee" means any employee of the department of rehabilitation and correction who in the course of performing the employee's job duties has or has had contact with inmates and persons under supervision.

As used in divisions (A)(7) and (B)(9) of this section, "youth services employee" means any employee of the department of youth services who in the course of performing the employee's job duties has or has had contact with children committed to the custody of the department of youth services.

As used in divisions (A)(7) and (B)(9) of this section, "firefighter" means any regular, paid or volunteer, member of a lawfully constituted fire department of a municipal corporation, township, fire district, or village.

As used in divisions (A)(7) and (B)(9) of this section, "EMT" means EMTs-basic, EMTs-I, and paramedics that provide emergency medical services for a public emergency medical service organization, "EMT-basic," "EMT-I," and "paramedic" have the same meanings as in section 4765.01 of the Revised Code.

As used in divisions (A)(7) and (B)(9) of this section, "investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation" has the meaning defined in section 2903.11 of the Revised Code.

- (8) "Information pertaining to the recreational activities of a person under the age of eighteen" means information that is kept in the ordinary course of business by a public office, that pertains to the recreational activities of a person under the age of eighteen years, and that discloses any of the following:
  - (a) The address or telephone number of a person under the age of eighteen or the address or telephone number of that person's parent, guardian, custodian, or emergency contact person;
  - (b) The social security number, birth date, or photographic image of a person under the age of eighteen;
  - (c) Any medical record, history, or information pertaining to a person under the age of eighteen;
  - (d) Any additional information sought or required about a person under the age of eighteen for the purpose of allowing that person to participate in any recreational activity conducted or sponsored by a public office or to use or obtain admission privileges to any recreational facility owned or operated by a public office.

- (9) "Community control sanction" has the same meaning as in section 2929.01 of the Revised Code.
- (10) "Post-release control sanction" has the same meaning as in section 2967.01 of the Revised Code.
- (11) "Redaction" means obscuring or deleting any information that is exempt from the duty to permit public inspection or copying from an item that otherwise meets the definition of a "record" in section 149.011 of the Revised Code.
- (12) "Designee" and "elected official" have the same meanings as in section 109.43 of the Revised Code.
- (B)(1) Upon request and subject to division (B)(8) of this section, all public records responsive to the request shall be promptly prepared and made available for inspection to any person at all reasonable times during regular business hours. Subject to division (B)(8) of this section, upon request, a public office or person responsible for public records shall make copies of the requested public record available at cost and within a reasonable period of time. If a public record contains information that is exempt from the duty to permit public inspection or to copy the public record, the public office or the person responsible for the public record shall make available all of the information within the public record that is not exempt. When making that public record available for public inspection or copying that public record, the public office or the person responsible for the public record shall notify the requester of any redaction or make the redaction plainly visible. A redaction shall be deemed a denial of a request to inspect or copy the redacted information, except if federal or state law authorizes or requires a public office to make the redaction.
  - (2) To facilitate broader access to public records, a public office or the person responsible for public records shall organize and maintain public records in a manner that they can be made available for inspection or copying in accordance with division (B) of this section. A public office also shall have available a copy of its current records retention schedule at a location readily available to the public. If a requester makes an ambiguous or overly broad request or has difficulty in making a request for copies or inspection of public records under this section such that the public office or the person responsible for the requested public record cannot reasonably identify what public records are being requested, the public office or the person responsible for the requested public record may deny the request but shall provide the requester with an opportunity to revise the request by informing the requester of the manner in which records are maintained by the public office and accessed in the ordinary course of the public office's or person's duties.
  - (3) If a request is ultimately denied, in part or in whole, the public office or the person responsible for the requested public record shall provide the requester with an explanation, including legal authority, setting forth why the request was denied. If the initial request was provided in writing, the explanation also shall be provided to the requester in writing. The explanation shall not preclude the public office or the person responsible for the requested public record from relying upon additional reasons or legal authority in defending an action commenced under division (C) of this section.
  - (4) Unless specifically required or authorized by state or federal law or in accordance with division (B) of this section, no public office or person responsible for public records may limit or condition the availability of public records by requiring disclosure of the requester's

identity or the intended use of the requested public record. Any requirement that the requester disclose the requestor's identity or the intended use of the requested public record constitutes a denial of the request.

- (5) A public office or person responsible for public records may ask a requester to make the request in writing, may ask for the requester's identity, and may inquire about the intended use of the information requested, but may do so only after disclosing to the requester that a written request is not mandatory and that the requester may decline to reveal the requester's identity or the intended use and when a written request or disclosure of the identity or intended use would benefit the requester by enhancing the ability of the public office or person responsible for public records to identify, locate, or deliver the public records sought by the requester.
- (6) If any person chooses to obtain a copy of a public record in accordance with division (B) of this section, the public office or person responsible for the public record may require that person to pay in advance the cost involved in providing the copy of the public record in accordance with the choice made by the person seeking the copy under this division. The public office or the person responsible for the public record shall permit that person to choose to have the public record duplicated upon paper, upon the same medium upon which the public office or person responsible for the public record keeps it, or upon any other medium upon which the public office or person responsible for the public record determines that it reasonably can be duplicated as an integral part of the normal operations of the public office or person responsible for the public record shall provide a copy of it in accordance with the choice made by the person seeking the copy. Nothing in this section requires a public office or person responsible for the public record to allow the person seeking a copy of the public record to make the copies of the public record.
- (7) Upon a request made in accordance with division (B) of this section and subject to division (B)(6) of this section, a public office or person responsible for public records shall transmit a copy of a public record to any person by United States mail or by any other means of delivery or transmission within a reasonable period of time after receiving the request for the copy. The public office or person responsible for the public record may require the person making the request to pay in advance the cost of postage if the copy is transmitted by United States mail or the cost of delivery if the copy is transmitted other than by United States mail, and to pay in advance the costs incurred for other supplies used in the mailing, delivery, or transmission.

Any public office may adopt a policy and procedures that it will follow in transmitting, within a reasonable period of time after receiving a request, copies of public records by United States mail or by any other means of delivery or transmission pursuant to this division. A public office that adopts a policy and procedures under this division shall comply with them in performing its duties under this division.

In any policy and procedures adopted under this division, a public office may limit the number of records requested by a person that the office will transmit by United States mail to ten per month, unless the person certifies to the office in writing that the person does not intend to use or forward the requested records, or the information contained in them, for commercial purposes. For purposes of this division, "commercial" shall be narrowly

- construed and does not include reporting or gathering news, reporting or gathering information to assist citizen oversight or understanding of the operation or activities of government, or nonprofit educational research.
- (8) A public office or person responsible for public records is not required to permit a person who is incarcerated pursuant to a criminal conviction or a juvenile adjudication to inspect or to obtain a copy of any public record concerning a criminal investigation or prosecution or concerning what would be a criminal investigation or prosecution if the subject of the investigation or prosecution were an adult, unless the request to inspect or to obtain a copy of the record is for the purpose of acquiring information that is subject to release as a public record under this section and the judge who imposed the sentence or made the adjudication with respect to the person, or the judge's successor in office, finds that the information sought in the public record is necessary to support what appears to be a justiciable claim of the person.
- (9)(a) Upon written request made and signed by a journalist on or after December 16, 1999, a public office, or person responsible for public records, having custody of the records of the agency employing a specified peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, communitybased correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation shall disclose to the journalist the address of the actual personal residence of the peace officer, parole officer, probation officer, bailiff, prosecuting attorney, assistant prosecuting attorney, correctional employee, community-based correctional facility employee, youth services employee, firefighter, EMT, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation and, if the peace officer's, parole officer's, probation officer's, bailiff's, prosecuting attorney's. assistant prosecuting attorney's, correctional employee's, community-based correctional facility employee's, youth services employee's, firefighter's, EMT's, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation's spouse, former spouse, or child is employed by a public office, the name and address of the employer of the peace officer's. parole officer's, probation officer's, bailiff's, prosecuting attorney's, assistant prosecuting attorney's, correctional employee's, community-based correctional facility employee's, youth services employee's, firefighter's, EMT's, or investigator of the bureau of criminal identification and investigation's spouse, former spouse, or child. The request shall include the journalist's name and title and the name and address of the journalist's employer and shall state that disclosure of the information sought would be in the public interest.
  - (b) Division (B)(9)(a) of this section also applies to journalist requests for customer information maintained by a municipally owned or operated public utility, other than social security numbers and any private financial information such as credit reports, payment methods, credit card numbers, and bank account information.
  - (c) As used in division (B)(9) of this section, "journalist" means a person engaged in, connected with, or employed by any news medium, including a newspaper, magazine, press association, news agency, or wire service, a radio or television station, or a similar medium, for the purpose of gathering, processing, transmitting, compiling, editing, or disseminating information for the general public.
- (C)(1) If a person allegedly is aggrieved by the failure of a public office or the person responsible for public records to promptly prepare a public record and to make it available to the

person for inspection in accordance with division (B) of this section or by any other failure of a public office or the person responsible for public records to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section, the person allegedly aggrieved may commence a mandamus action to obtain a judgment that orders the public office or the person responsible for the public record to comply with division (B) of this section, that awards court costs and reasonable attorney's fees to the person that instituted the mandamus action, and, if applicable, that includes an order fixing statutory damages under division (C)(1) of this section. The mandamus action may be commenced in the court of common pleas of the county in which division (B) of this section allegedly was not complied with, in the supreme court pursuant to its original jurisdiction under Section 2 of Article IV, Ohio Constitution, or in the court of appeals for the appellate district in which division (B) of this section allegedly was not complied with pursuant to its original jurisdiction under Section 3 of Article IV, Ohio Constitution.

If a requestor transmits a written request by hand delivery or certified mail to inspect or receive copies of any public record in a manner that fairly describes the public record or class of public records to the public office or person responsible for the requested public records, except as otherwise provided in this section, the requestor shall be entitled to recover the amount of statutory damages set forth in this division if a court determines that the public office or the person responsible for public records failed to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section.

The amount of statutory damages shall be fixed at one hundred dollars for each business day during which the public office or person responsible for the requested public records failed to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section, beginning with the day on which the requester files a mandamus action to recover statutory damages, up to a maximum of one thousand dollars. The award of statutory damages shall not be construed as a penalty, but as compensation for injury arising from lost use of the requested information. The existence of this injury shall be conclusively presumed. The award of statutory damages shall be in addition to all other remedies authorized by this section.

The court may reduce an award of statutory damages or not award statutory damages if the court determines both of the following:

- (a) That, based on the ordinary application of statutory law and case law as it existed at the time of the conduct or threatened conduct of the public office or person responsible for the requested public records that allegedly constitutes a failure to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section and that was the basis of the mandamus action, a well-informed public office or person responsible for the requested public records reasonably would believe that the conduct or threatened conduct of the public office or person responsible for the requested public records did not constitute a failure to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section;
- (b) That a well-informed public office or person responsible for the requested public records reasonably would believe that the conduct or threatened conduct of the public office or person responsible for the requested public records would serve the public policy that underlies the authority that is asserted as permitting that conduct or threatened conduct.
- (2)(a) If the court issues a writ of mandamus that orders the public office or the person responsible for the public record to comply with division (B) of this section and determines

that the circumstances described in division (C)(1) of this section exist, the court shall determine and award to the relator all court costs.

- (b) If the court renders a judgment that orders the public office or the person responsible for the public record to comply with division (B) of this section, the court may award reasonable attorney's fees subject to reduction as described in division (C)(2)(c) of this section. The court shall award reasonable attorney's fees, subject to reduction as described in division (C)(2)(c) of this section when either of the following applies:
  - (i) The public office or the person responsible for the public records failed to respond affirmatively or negatively to the public records request in accordance with the time allowed under division (B) of this section.
  - (ii) The public office or the person responsible for the public records promised to permit the relator to inspect or receive copies of the public records requested within a specified period of time but failed to fulfill that promise within that specified period of time.
- (c) Court costs and reasonable attorney's fees awarded under this section shall be construed as remedial and not punitive. Reasonable attorney's fees shall include reasonable fees incurred to produce proof of the reasonableness and amount of the fees and to otherwise litigate entitlement to the fees. The court may reduce an award of attorney's fees to the relator or not award attorney's fees to the relator if the court determines both of the following:
  - (i) That, based on the ordinary application of statutory law and case law as it existed at the time of the conduct or threatened conduct of the public office or person responsible for the requested public records that allegedly constitutes a failure to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section and that was the basis of the mandamus action, a well-informed public office or person responsible for the requested public records reasonably would believe that the conduct or threatened conduct of the public office or person responsible for the requested public records did not constitute a failure to comply with an obligation in accordance with division (B) of this section;
  - (ii) That a well-informed public office or person responsible for the requested public records reasonably would believe that the conduct or threatened conduct of the public office or person responsible for the requested public records as described in division (C)(2)(c)(i) of this section would serve the public policy that underlies the authority that is asserted as permitting that conduct or threatened conduct.
- (D) Chapter 1347. of the Revised Code does not limit the provisions of this section.
- (E)(1) To ensure that all employees of public offices are appropriately educated about a public office's obligations under division (B) of this section, all elected officials or their appropriate designees shall attend training approved by the attorney general as provided in section 109.43 of the Revised Code. In addition, all public offices shall adopt a public records policy in compliance with this section for responding to public records requests. In adopting a public records policy under this division, a public office may obtain guidance from the model public records policy developed and provided to the public office by the attorney general under section 109.43 of the Revised Code. Except as otherwise provided in this section, the policy may not limit the number of public records that the public office will make available to a single person,

may not limit the number of public records that it will make available during a fixed period of time, and may not establish a fixed period of time before it will respond to a request for inspection or copying of public records, unless that period is less than eight hours.

- (2) The public office shall distribute the public records policy adopted by the public office under division (E)(1) of this section to the employee of the public office who is the records custodian or records manager or otherwise has custody of the records of that office. The public office shall require that employee to acknowledge receipt of the copy of the public records policy. The public office shall create a poster that describes its public records policy and shall post the poster in a conspicuous place in the public office and in all locations where the public office has branch offices. The public office may post its public records policy on the internet web site of the public office if the public office maintains an internet web site. A public office that has established a manual or handbook of its general policies and procedures for all employees of the public office shall include the public records policy of the public office in the manual or handbook.
- (F)(1) The bureau of motor vehicles may adopt rules pursuant to Chapter 119. of the Revised Code to reasonably limit the number of bulk commercial special extraction requests made by a person for the same records or for updated records during a calendar year. The rules may include provisions for charges to be made for bulk commercial special extraction requests for the actual cost of the bureau, plus special extraction costs, plus ten per cent. The bureau may charge for expenses for redacting information, the release of which is prohibited by law.
  - (2) As used in division (F)(1) of this section:
    - (a) "Actual cost" means the cost of depleted supplies, records storage media costs, actual mailing and alternative delivery costs, or other transmitting costs, and any direct equipment operating and maintenance costs, including actual costs paid to private contractors for copying services.
    - (b) "Bulk commercial special extraction request" means a request for copies of a record for information in a format other than the format already available, or information that cannot be extracted without examination of all items in a records series, class of records, or database by a person who intends to use or forward the copies for surveys, marketing, solicitation, or resale for commercial purposes. "Bulk commercial special extraction request" does not include a request by a person who gives assurance to the bureau that the person making the request does not intend to use or forward the requested copies for surveys, marketing, solicitation, or resale for commercial purposes.
    - (c) "Commercial" means profit-seeking production, buying, or selling of any good, service, or other product.
    - (d) "Special extraction costs" means the cost of the time spent by the lowest paid employee competent to perform the task, the actual amount paid to outside private contractors employed by the bureau, or the actual cost incurred to create computer programs to make the special extraction. "Special extraction costs" include any charges paid to a public agency for computer or records services.
  - (3) For purposes of divisions (F)(1) and (2) of this section, "surveys, marketing, solicitation, or resale for commercial purposes" shall be narrowly construed and does not include reporting or gathering news, reporting or gathering information to assist citizen oversight or understanding of the operation or activities of government, or nonprofit educational research.

## **XX.** Oregon – Or. Rev. Stat. § 192.440

## 192.440. Public records; inspection; certified copies

- (1) The custodian of any public record that a person has a right to inspect shall give the person, upon request:
  - (a) A copy of the public record if the public record is of a nature permitting copying; or
  - (b) A reasonable opportunity to inspect or copy the public record.
- (2) If a person makes a written request to inspect a public record or to receive a copy of a public record, the public body receiving the request shall respond as soon as practicable and without unreasonable delay. The public body may request additional information or clarification from the requester for the purpose of expediting the public body's response to the request. The response of the public body must acknowledge receipt of the request and must include one of the following:
  - (a) A statement that the public body does not possess, or is not the custodian of, the public record.
  - (b) Copies of all requested public records for which the public body does not claim an exemption from disclosure under ORS 192.410 to 192.505.
  - (c) A statement that the public body is the custodian of at least some of the requested public records, an estimate of the time the public body requires before the public records may be inspected or copies of the records will be provided and an estimate of the fees that the requester must pay under subsection (4) of this section as a condition of receiving the public records.
  - (d) A statement that the public body is the custodian of at least some of the requested public records and that an estimate of the time and fees for disclosure of the public records will be provided by the public body within a reasonable time.
  - (e) A statement that the public body is uncertain whether the public body possesses the public record and that the public body will search for the record and make an appropriate response as soon as practicable.
  - (f) A statement that state or federal law prohibits the public body from acknowledging whether the record exists or that acknowledging whether the record exists would result in the loss of federal benefits or other sanction. A statement under this paragraph must include a citation to the state or federal law relied upon by the public body.
- (3) If the public record is maintained in a machine readable or electronic form, the custodian shall provide a copy of the public record in the form requested, if available. If the public record is not available in the form requested, the custodian shall make the public record available in the form in which the custodian maintains the public record.
- (4)(a) The public body may establish fees reasonably calculated to reimburse the public body for the public body's actual cost of making public records available, including costs for summarizing, compiling or tailoring the public records, either in organization or media, to meet the person's request.
  - (b) The public body may include in a fee established under paragraph (a) of this subsection the cost of time spent by an attorney for the public body in reviewing the public records,

redacting material from the public records or segregating the public records into exempt and nonexempt records. The public body may not include in a fee established under paragraph (a) of this subsection the cost of time spent by an attorney for the public body in determining the application of the provisions of ORS 192.410 to 192.505.

- (c) The public body may not establish a fee greater than \$25 under this section unless the public body first provides the requestor with a written notification of the estimated amount of the fee and the requestor confirms that the requestor wants the public body to proceed with making the public record available.
- (d) Notwithstanding paragraphs (a) to (c) of this subsection, when the public records are those filed with the Secretary of State under ORS chapter 79 or ORS 80.100 to 80.130, the fees for furnishing copies, summaries or compilations of the public records are those established by the Secretary of State by rule, under ORS chapter 79 or ORS 80.100 to 80.130.
- (5) The custodian of any public record may furnish copies without charge or at a substantially reduced fee if the custodian determines that the waiver or reduction of fees is in the public interest because making the record available primarily benefits the general public.
- (6) A person who believes that there has been an unreasonable denial of a fee waiver or fee reduction may petition the Attorney General or the district attorney in the same manner as a person petitions when inspection of a public record is denied under ORS 192.410 to 192.505. The Attorney General, the district attorney and the court have the same authority in instances when a fee waiver or reduction is denied as it has when inspection of a public record is denied.
- (7) A public body shall make available to the public a written procedure for making public record requests that includes:
  - (a) The name of one or more persons to whom public record requests may be sent, with addresses; and
  - (b) The amounts of and the manner of calculating fees that the public body charges for responding to requests for public records.
- (8) This section does not apply to signatures of individuals submitted under ORS chapter 247 for purposes of registering to vote as provided in ORS 247.973.

## XXI. Pennsylvania - 65 PA. Cons. Stat. § 67.701

## § 67.701. Access

- (a) General rule.—Unless otherwise provided by law, a public record, legislative record or financial record shall be accessible for inspection and duplication in accordance with this act. A record being provided to a requester shall be provided in the medium requested if it exists in that medium; otherwise, it shall be provided in the medium in which it exists. Public records, legislative records or financial records shall be available for access during the regular business hours of an agency.
- (b) Construction.—Nothing in this act shall be construed to require access to any computer either of an agency or individual employee of an agency.

### XXII. Rhode Island - R.I. GEN. LAWS § 38-2-3

### § 38-2-3. Right to inspect and copy records--Duty to maintain minutes of meetings--Procedures for access

- (a) Except as provided in § 38-2-2(4), all records maintained or kept on file by any public body, whether or not those records are required by any law or by any rule or regulation, shall be public records and every person or entity shall have the right to inspect and/or copy those records at such reasonable time as may be determined by the custodian thereof.
- (b) Any reasonably segregable portion of a public record excluded by subdivision 38-2-2(4) shall be available for public inspection after the deletion of the information which is the basis of the exclusion. If an entire document or record is deemed non-public, the public body shall state in writing that no portion of the document or record contains reasonable segregable information that is releasable.
- (c) Each public body shall make, keep, and maintain written or recorded minutes of all meetings.
- (d) Each public body shall establish written procedures regarding access to public records but shall not require written requests for public information available pursuant to R.I.G.L. § 42-35-2 or for other documents prepared for or readily available to the public.

These procedures must include, but need not be limited to, the identification of a designated public records officer or unit, how to make a public records request, and where a public record request should be made, and a copy of these procedures shall be posted on the public body's website if such a website is maintained and be made otherwise readily available to the public. The unavailability of a designated public records officer shall not be deemed good cause for failure to timely comply with a request to inspect and/or copy public records pursuant to subsection (e). A written request for public records need not be made on a form established by a public body if the request is otherwise readily identifiable as a request for public records.

- (e) A public body receiving a request shall permit the inspection or copying within ten (10) business days after receiving a request. If the inspection or copying is not permitted within ten (10) business days, the public body shall forthwith explain in writing the need for additional time to comply with the request. Any such explanation must be particularized to the specific request made. In such cases the public body may have up to an additional twenty (20) business days to comply with the request if it can demonstrate that the voluminous nature of the request, the number of requests for records pending, or the difficulty in searching for and retrieving or copying the requested records, is such that additional time is necessary to avoid imposing an undue burden on the public body.
- (f) If a public record is in active use or in storage and, therefore, not available at the time a person or entity requests access, the custodian shall so inform the person or entity and make an appointment for the person or entity to examine such records as expeditiously as they may be made available.
- (g) Any person or entity requesting copies of public records may elect to obtain them in any and all media in which the public agency is capable of providing them. Any public body which maintains its records in a computer storage system shall provide any data properly identified in a printout or other reasonable format, as requested.

- (h) Nothing in this section shall be construed as requiring a public body to reorganize, consolidate, or compile data not maintained by the public body in the form requested at the time the request to inspect the public records was made except to the extent that such records are in an electronic format and the public body would not be unduly burdened in providing such data.
- (i) Nothing in this section is intended to affect the public record status of information merely because it is stored in a computer.
- (j) No public records shall be withheld based on the purpose for which the records are sought, nor shall a public body require, as a condition of fulfilling a public records request, that a person or entity provide a reason for the request or provide personally identifiable information about him/herself.
- (k) At the election of the person or entity requesting the public records, the public body shall provide copies of the public records electronically, by facsimile, or by mail in accordance with the requesting person or entity's choice, unless complying with that preference would be unduly burdensome due to the volume of records requested or the costs that would be incurred. The person requesting delivery shall be responsible for the actual cost of delivery, if any.

## XXIII. South Carolina - S.C. CODE ANN. § 30-4-30

- § 30-4-30. Right to inspect or copy public records; fees; notification as to public availability of records; presumption upon failure to give notice; records to be available when requestor appears in person.
- (a) Any person has a right to inspect or copy any public record of a public body, except as otherwise provided by § 30-4-40, in accordance with reasonable rules concerning time and place of access.
- (b) The public body may establish and collect fees not to exceed the actual cost of searching for or making copies of records. Fees charged by a public body must be uniform for copies of the same record or document. However, members of the General Assembly may receive copies of records or documents at no charge from public bodies when their request relates to their legislative duties. The records must be furnished at the lowest possible cost to the person requesting the records. Records must be provided in a form that is both convenient and practical for use by the person requesting copies of the records concerned, if it is equally convenient for the public body to provide the records in this form. Documents may be furnished when appropriate without charge or at a reduced charge where the agency determines that waiver or reduction of the fee is in the public interest because furnishing the information can be considered as primarily benefiting the general public. Fees may not be charged for examination and review to determine if the documents are subject to disclosure. Nothing in this chapter prevents the custodian of the public records from charging a reasonable hourly rate for making records available to the public nor requiring a reasonable deposit of these costs before searching for or making copies of the records.
- (c) Each public body, upon written request for records made under this chapter, shall within fifteen days (excepting Saturdays, Sundays, and legal public holidays) of the receipt of any such request notify the person making such request of its determination and the reasons therefor. Such a determination shall constitute the final opinion of the public body as to the public availability of the requested public record and, if the request is granted, the record must be furnished or made available for inspection or copying. If written notification of the determination of the public body as to the availability of the requested public record is neither mailed nor personally delivered to the person requesting the document within the fifteen days allowed herein, the request must be considered approved.
- (d) The following records of a public body must be made available for public inspection and copying during the hours of operations of the public body without the requestor being required to make a written request to inspect or copy the records when the requestor appears in person:
  - (1) minutes of the meetings of the public body for the preceding six months;
  - (2) all reports identified in Section 30-4-50(A)(8) for at least the fourteen-day period before the current day; and
  - (3) documents identifying persons confined in any jail, detention center, or prison for the preceding three months.

## XXIV. Texas – Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 552.228

## § 552.228. Providing Suitable Copy of Public Information Within Reasonable Time

- (a) It shall be a policy of a governmental body to provide a suitable copy of public information within a reasonable time after the date on which the copy is requested.
- (b) If public information exists in an electronic or magnetic medium, the requestor may request a copy in an electronic medium, such as on diskette or on magnetic tape. A governmental body shall provide a copy in the requested medium if:
  - (1) the governmental body has the technological ability to produce a copy of the requested information in the requested medium;
  - (2) the governmental body is not required to purchase any software or hardware to accommodate the request; and
  - (3) provision of a copy of the information in the requested medium will not violate the terms of any copyright agreement between the governmental body and a third party.
- (c) If a governmental body is unable to comply with a request to produce a copy of information in a requested medium for any of the reasons described by this section, the governmental body shall provide a copy in another medium that is acceptable to the requestor. A governmental body is not required to copy information onto a diskette or other material provided by the requestor but may use its own supplies.

## XXV. Vermont - VT. STAT. ANN. tit. 1, § 316

## § 316. Access to public records and documents

- (a) Any person may inspect or copy any public record of a public agency, as follows:
  - (1) For any agency, board, department, commission, committee, branch, instrumentality, or authority of the State, a person may inspect a public record on any day other than a Saturday, Sunday, or a legal holiday, between the hours of nine o'clock and 12 o'clock in the forenoon and between one o'clock and four o'clock in the afternoon;
  - (2) For any agency, board, committee, department, instrumentality, commission, or authority of a political subdivision of the State, a person may inspect a public record during customary business hours.
- (b) If copying equipment maintained for use by a public agency is used by the agency to copy the public record or document requested, the agency may charge and collect from the person requesting the copy the actual cost of providing the copy. The agency may also charge and collect from the person making the request, the costs associated with mailing or transmitting the record by facsimile or other electronic means. Nothing in this section shall exempt any person from paying fees otherwise established by law for obtaining copies of public records or documents, but if such fee is established for the copy, no additional costs or fees shall be charged.
- (c) Unless otherwise provided by law, in the following instances an agency may also charge and collect the cost of staff time associated with complying with a request for a copy of a public record: (1) the time directly involved in complying with the request exceeds 30 minutes; (2) the agency agrees to create a public record; or (3) the agency agrees to provide the public record in a nonstandard format and the time directly involved in complying with the request exceeds 30 minutes. The agency may require that requests subject to staff time charges under this subsection be made in writing and that all charges be paid, in whole or in part, prior to delivery of the copies. Upon request, the agency shall provide an estimate of the charge.
- (d) The Secretary of State, after consultation with the Secretary of Administration, shall establish the actual cost of providing a copy of a public record that may be charged by state agencies. The Secretary shall also establish the amount that may be charged for staff time, when such a charge is authorized under this section. To determine "actual cost," the Secretary shall consider the following only: the cost of the paper or the electronic media onto which a public record is copied, a prorated amount for maintenance and replacement of the machine or equipment used to copy the record and any utility charges directly associated with copying a record. The Secretary of State shall adopt, by rule, a uniform schedule of public record charges for State agencies.
- (e) After public hearing, the legislative body of a political subdivision shall establish actual cost charges for copies of public records. The legislative body shall also establish the amount that may be charged for staff time, when such a charge is authorized under this section. To determine actual cost charges, the legislative body shall use the same factors used by the Secretary of State. If a legislative body fails to establish a uniform schedule of charges, the charges for that political subdivision shall be the uniform schedule of charges established by the Secretary of State until the local legislative body establishes such a schedule. A schedule of public records charges shall be posted in prominent locations in the town offices.

- (f) State agencies shall provide receipts for all moneys received under this section. Notwithstanding any provision of law to the contrary, a State agency may retain moneys collected under this section to the extent such charges represent the actual cost incurred to provide copies under this subchapter. Amounts collected by a State agency under this section for the cost of staff time associated with providing copies shall be deposited in the General Fund, unless another disposition or use of revenues received by that agency is specifically authorized by law. Charges collected under this section shall be deposited in the agency's operating account or the General Fund, as appropriate, on a monthly basis or whenever the amount totals \$100.00, whichever occurs first.
- (g) A public agency having the equipment necessary to copy its public records shall utilize its equipment to produce copies. If the public agency does not have such equipment, nothing in this section shall be construed to require the public agency to provide or arrange for copying service, to use or permit the use of copying equipment other than its own, to permit operation of its copying equipment by other than its own personnel, to permit removal of the public record by the requesting person for purposes of copying, or to make its own personnel available for making handwritten or typed copies of the public record or document requested.
- (h) Standard formats for copies of public records shall be as follows: for copies in paper form, a photocopy of a paper public record or a hard copy print-out of a public record maintained in electronic form; for copies in electronic form, the format in which the record is maintained. Any format other than the formats described in this subsection is a nonstandard format.
- (i) If an agency maintains public records in an electronic format, nonexempt public records shall be available for copying in either the standard electronic format or the standard paper format, as designated by the party requesting the records. An agency may, but is not required to, provide copies of public records in a nonstandard format, to create a public record or to convert paper public records to electronic format.
- (j) A public agency may make reasonable rules to prevent disruption of operations, to preserve the security of public records or documents, and to protect them from damage.
- (k) Information concerning facilities and sites for the treatment, storage, and disposal of hazardous waste shall be made available to the public under this subchapter in substantially the same manner and to the same degree as such information is made available under the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act of 1976, as amended, 42 U.S.C. chapter 82, subchapter 3, and the Federal Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. section 552 et seq. In the event of a conflict between the provisions of this subchapter and the cited federal laws, federal law shall govern.

## XXVI. <u>Virginia</u> – VA. CODE. ANN. § 2.2-3704

# § 2.2-3704. Public records to be open to inspection; procedure for requesting records and responding to request; charges; transfer of records for storage, etc.

- A. Except as otherwise specifically provided by law, all public records shall be open to inspection and copying by any citizens of the Commonwealth during the regular office hours of the custodian of such records. Access to such records shall not be denied to citizens of the Commonwealth, representatives of newspapers and magazines with circulation in the Commonwealth, and representatives of radio and television stations broadcasting in or into the Commonwealth. The custodian may require the requester to provide his name and legal address. The custodian of such records shall take all necessary precautions for their preservation and safekeeping.
- B. A request for public records shall identify the requested records with reasonable specificity. The request need not make reference to this chapter in order to invoke the provisions of this chapter or to impose the time limits for response by a public body. Any public body that is subject to this chapter and that is the custodian of the requested records shall promptly, but in all cases within five working days of receiving a request, provide the requested records to the requester or make one of the following responses in writing:
  - 1. The requested records are being entirely withheld because their release is prohibited by law or the custodian has exercised his discretion to withhold the records in accordance with this chapter. Such response shall identify with reasonable particularity the volume and subject matter of withheld records, and cite, as to each category of withheld records, the specific Code section that authorizes the withholding of the records.
  - 2. The requested records are being provided in part and are being withheld in part because the release of part of the records is prohibited by law or the custodian has exercised his discretion to withhold a portion of the records in accordance with this chapter. Such response shall identify with reasonable particularity the subject matter of withheld portions, and cite, as to each category of withheld records, the specific Code section that authorizes the withholding of the records. When a portion of a requested record is withheld, the public body may delete or excise only that portion of the record to which an exemption applies and shall release the remainder of the record.
  - 3. The requested records could not be found or do not exist. However, if the public body that received the request knows that another public body has the requested records, the response shall include contact information for the other public body.
  - 4. It is not practically possible to provide the requested records or to determine whether they are available within the five-work-day period. Such response shall specify the conditions that make a response impossible. If the response is made within five working days, the public body shall have an additional seven work days in which to provide one of the four preceding responses.
- C. Any public body may petition the appropriate court for additional time to respond to a request for records when the request is for an extraordinary volume of records or requires an extraordinarily lengthy search, and a response by the public body within the time required by this chapter will prevent the public body from meeting its operational responsibilities. Before

proceeding with the petition, however, the public body shall make reasonable efforts to reach an agreement with the requester concerning the production of the records requested.

- D. Subject to the provisions of subsection G, no public body shall be required to create a new record if the record does not already exist. However, a public body may abstract or summarize information under such terms and conditions as agreed between the requester and the public body.
- E. Failure to respond to a request for records shall be deemed a denial of the request and shall constitute a violation of this chapter.
- F. A public body may make reasonable charges not to exceed its actual cost incurred in accessing, duplicating, supplying, or searching for the requested records. No public body shall impose any extraneous, intermediary or surplus fees or expenses to recoup the general costs associated with creating or maintaining records or transacting the general business of the public body. Any duplicating fee charged by a public body shall not exceed the actual cost of duplication. The public body may also make a reasonable charge for the cost incurred in supplying records produced from a geographic information system at the request of anyone other than the owner of the land that is the subject of the request. However, such charges shall not exceed the actual cost to the public body in supplying such records, except that the public body may charge, on a pro rata per acre basis, for the cost of creating topographical maps developed by the public body, for such maps or portions thereof, which encompass a contiguous area greater than 50 acres. All charges for the supplying of requested records shall be estimated in advance at the request of the citizen.
- G. Public records maintained by a public body in an electronic data processing system, computer database, or any other structured collection of data shall be made available to a requester at a reasonable cost, not to exceed the actual cost in accordance with subsection F. When electronic or other databases are combined or contain exempt and nonexempt records, the public body may provide access to the exempt records if not otherwise prohibited by law, but shall provide access to the nonexempt records as provided by this chapter.

Public bodies shall produce nonexempt records maintained in an electronic database in any tangible medium identified by the requester, including, where the public body has the capability, the option of posting the records on a website or delivering the records through an electronic mail address provided by the requester, if that medium is used by the public body in the regular course of business. No public body shall be required to produce records from an electronic database in a format not regularly used by the public body. However, the public body shall make reasonable efforts to provide records in any format under such terms and conditions as agreed between the requester and public body, including the payment of reasonable costs. The excision of exempt fields of information from a database or the conversion of data from one available format to another shall not be deemed the creation, preparation or compilation of a new public record.

H. In any case where a public body determines in advance that charges for producing the requested records are likely to exceed \$200, the public body may, before continuing to process the request, require the requester to agree to payment of a deposit not to exceed the amount of the advance determination. The deposit shall be credited toward the final cost of supplying the requested records. The period within which the public body shall respond under this section shall

be tolled for the amount of time that elapses between notice of the advance determination and the response of the requester.

- I. Before processing a request for records, a public body may require the requester to pay any amounts owed to the public body for previous requests for records that remain unpaid 30 days or more after billing.
- J. In the event a public body has transferred possession of public records to any entity, including but not limited to any other public body, for storage, maintenance, or archiving, the public body initiating the transfer of such records shall remain the custodian of such records for purposes of responding to requests for public records made pursuant to this chapter and shall be responsible for retrieving and supplying such public records to the requester. In the event a public body has transferred public records for storage, maintenance, or archiving and such transferring public body is no longer in existence, any public body that is a successor to the transferring public body shall be deemed the custodian of such records. In the event no successor entity exists, the entity in possession of the public records shall be deemed the custodian of the records for purposes of compliance with this chapter, and shall retrieve and supply such records to the requester. Nothing in this subsection shall be construed to apply to records transferred to the Library of Virginia for permanent archiving pursuant to the duties imposed by the Virginia Public Records Act (§ 42.1-76 et seq.). In accordance with § 42.1-79, the Library of Virginia shall be the custodian of such permanently archived records and shall be responsible for responding to requests for such records made pursuant to this chapter.

## **XXVII.** West Virginia – W. VA. CODE § 29B-1-3

## § 29B-1-3. Inspection and copying of public record; requests of Freedom of Information Act requests registry

- (a) Every person has a right to inspect or copy any public record of a public body in this state, except as otherwise expressly provided by section four of this article.
- (b) A request to inspect or copy any public record of a public body shall be made directly to the custodian of such public record.
- (c) The custodian of any public records, unless otherwise expressly provided by statute, shall furnish proper and reasonable opportunities for inspection and examination of the records in his or her office and reasonable facilities for making memoranda or abstracts therefrom, during the usual business hours, to all persons having occasion to make examination of them. The custodian of the records may make reasonable rules and regulations necessary for the protection of the records and to prevent interference with the regular discharge of his or her duties. If the records requested exist in magnetic, electronic or computer form, the custodian of the records shall make copies available on magnetic or electronic media, if so requested.
- (d) All requests for information must state with reasonable specificity the information sought. The custodian, upon demand for records made under this statute, shall as soon as is practicable but within a maximum of five days not including Saturdays, Sundays or legal holidays:
  - (1) Furnish copies of the requested information;
  - (2) Advise the person making the request of the time and place at which he or she may inspect and copy the materials; or
  - (3) Deny the request stating in writing the reasons for such denial. A denial shall indicate that the responsibility of the custodian of any public records or public body to produce the requested records or documents is at an end, and shall afford the person requesting them the opportunity to institute proceedings for injunctive or declaratory relief in the circuit court in the county where the public record is kept.
- (e) The public body may establish fees reasonably calculated to reimburse it for its actual cost in making reproductions of records. A public body may not charge a search or retrieval fee or otherwise seek reimbursement based on a man-hour basis as part of costs associated with making reproduction of records.
- (f) The Secretary of State shall maintain an electronic data base of notices of requests as required by section three-a of this article. The database shall be made available to the public via the Internet and shall list each freedom of information request received and the outcome of the request. The Secretary of State shall provide on the website a form for use by a public body to report the results of the freedom of information request, providing the nature of the request and the public body's response thereto, whether the request was granted, and if not, the exemption asserted under section four of this article to deny the request.

